

CHARLESTON HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Special Meeting

4:00 p.m., April 21, 2022

City Service Center Conference Room • 915 Quarrier Street

Members Present

Billy Joe Peyton, Chairman
Ken Sullivan
Adam Krason (via phone)
Lisa Fischer Casto

Staff Present

Lori Brannon

Others Present

Brian Lowe (St. Albans Windows)
Lois Moles (American Legion)
Haley Walker (Rea of Hope)
Heather Darr (Rea of Hope)

Call to Order: Billy Joe Peyton

COA-22-0216

Application of St. Albans Windows on behalf of Marilyn McGeorge requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness in order to replace wood windows with vinyl on the property located at **1529 Virginia Street, East.**

Brian Lowe of St. Albans window presented the request for COA-22-0216. Mr. Lowe requested replacement windows on the right side of the house, but later realized there were two windows on the left, two windows on the back and two windows on the right that are highly visible and in need of replacement, for a total of six windows and three difference facades, left, right and back sides of the house.

Per Billy Joe, according to the guidelines for the East End, administrative approval could be granted in the Staff Analysis for the three windows on the façade that are opposite Virginia Street, or the rear façade, because it is a secondary facade. Similar approvals have been granted in the past. The other two facades are not secondary facades. Although there is a tree blocking the view of some of the windows, it is not a permanent obstruction. Brian Lowe responded that what Billy Joe is referring to is the front façade and it is not getting windows. Lori informed Brian Lowe the façade facing Manner Place would also be considered a front façade. Billy Joe informed Brian Lowe the two windows facing Manner Place would have to be wooden clad windows.

Brian Lowe stated that if 4 out of 6 windows were required to be replaced with wood, he felt it was best to replace all 6 windows with wood. Billy Joe agreed because of the chance the trees

obstructing the view of the two windows approved for vinyl replacements could be trimmed or removed in the next few years and expose that façade.

Lori presented staff notes. She pointed out that the Commission, on three different occasions approved window replacements for this structure. In each of those three cases, it was a Pella Architect Series wood clad window.

Lori also pointed out that, based on a screenshot of staff's GIS, 1529 Virginia Street, E sits closer to Virginia Street than the neighbor, making 2/3 to 3/4 of that façade visible. The way it was determined this would work according to the guidelines, is that if it were secondary, vinyl windows could be approved administratively that do not reduce the opening. However, this is on the cusp and, as Lori previously mentioned, if there were any questions as to whether or not to treat it as secondary or primary, she would look to the Commission for that determination.

Brian Lowe indicated that he was fine with the requirement for 6 wood windows. He also mentioned that the company manufactures a replacement sash kit. It will not work with all wood windows, but with some of them it is beneficial. It involves taking the wood sashes out and install a vinyl jam liner with the balances on each side and then wood sash are put in place, leaving the external frame. This means the glass would be a slightly larger. Brian Lowe will double-check into the possibility of whether or not the sash kit would work in this instance.

MOTION AND VOTE

The motion was made by Ken Sullivan, seconded by Adam Krason and unanimously passed by the Commission 4-0 approving Sash Kit or Lincoln Wood.

COA-22-0217

Application of American Legion requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness in order to connect two existing driveways with concrete in the front yard of the property located at **2016 Kanawha Boulevard, East.**

Lois Moles spoke on behalf of the American Legion, the applicant, explaining the nature of their request. There are two driveways involved and the American Legion Department of West Virginia owns both driveways. Although the neighbors use the concrete driveway often, no shared usage of the driveways has been designated. Connecting the driveways will make access easier for anyone with mobility issues, as well as any loading and unloading. Professional Dental Associates rents the building in the back.

The primary reason for this request is to accommodate the person over this office, who is a double-amputee. Ms. Moles said there will be no parking in the front. Once her boss drives his

vehicle to the front of the office, he will get and she will then drive his vehicle to the designated parking area.

The concrete will not go to the foundation of the house. It will be 4" deep and will go up to the sidewalk, removing one square of the sidewalk. The sidewalk will remain and the driveway will be parallel with the sidewalk. It is likely that there will be landscaping on the right front side of the house. There are seven offices in this block and there have a similar crosswalk.

Lori Brannon presented the Staff Analysis. The staff initially recommended denying this request. The city's zoning ordinance does not allow parking in the front for anything other than single family and duplex dwellings. There are additional rules referenced in the staff notes for the historic district as well. The main reason for the recommendation to deny is simply that it is difficult for the Planning Department to enforce. There are two zoning enforcement officers for the entire city. However, if this is a matter of access and the Commission chooses to make an allowance for access, a condition should be stated explicitly in the motion that the parking is for loading and unloading only and parking is prohibited.

Ms. Moles reaffirmed that the request had nothing to do with additional parking. Billy Joe asked that low profile "No Parking" signs be put in place, maximum size being 2 x 2. Ms. Moles agreed with the request.

Adam Krason agreed to the request solely for the purpose of loading and unloading. He also stated that this would align the property in character with other properties on the block.

MOTION AND VOTE

The motion was made by Lisa Fisher Casto, seconded by Adam Krason and unanimously passed by the Commission 4-0 to approve connecting two existing driveways for loading and unloading purposes only and to provide the State Adjutant with improved ingress and egress to the building.

COA-22-0218

Application of Rea of Hope, Inc. requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness in order to replace a slate roof with shingles and eliminate built-in gutters on the property located at **1411 Quarrier Street**.

Haley Walker and Heather Darr presented the request on behalf of Rea of Hope, Inc. Upon noticing problem with the gutters, a contractor took a look at the situation and advised Ms. Walker and Ms. Darr that they should contact a roofing company for the work that needed to be done. Russ with Elite Roofing came to take a look at the situation. His recommendation to alleviate expense for Rea of Hope, Inc., a small non-profit, was to move to the standard shingles

and to somehow eliminate that internal guttering because the extent of the damage is unknown at this time. They will have to rip up what is currently on the building to determine the full extent of the damage. The roofer informed the applicant that he could not do the gutter work. The applicants then contacted DCG Services, David's Continuous Gutter Services, who had several good suggestions i.e., fluted downspouts, continuous guttering without all the twists and turns.

Adam Krason noted from the staff notes that there are two different issues. The internal guttering has been allowed to be removed and replaced and seems reasonable. The bigger concern is roofs are a character-defining element. It's been a consistent recommendation that applicants go with a simulated slate roof instead of an asphalt shingle. Lori Brannon agreed the roof is a character-defining characteristic of the building.

Lori had a question about the guidelines. It states that if there is enough damage to the internal gutters, then full replacement is warranted. Mike's recommendation in the guideline was half-round gutters and round downspouts and a galvanized finish. Adam Krason pointed out that, although round gutters would like nice, he did not see that it would stand out from the most common gutters in the neighborhood and are part of the architectural language. Billy Joe agreed with Adam.

Ken Sullivan mentioned the distinct pattern of the current slate shingles and asked if it could be replicated in a synthetic. Billy Joe further described it as a fish scale and it is alternating. The applicant said she would need to contact Russ. Lisa Fisher-Casto said they were almost certain it is available. Lori asked Adam if he knew whether or not that pattern could be done in the synthetic slate. Adam was not certain. He had not done enough research on that material to be aware of the availability.

Ken Sullivan then asked to the ridge lines that show a projecting metal flashing, the ridge caps, are likely to be the same or similar with synthetic slate. Lori said she had samples in her office that she could show Ken. The synthetic slate companies, they actually do not look like that. The ones that have been used, that Lori is aware of, match the material.

Lori pointed out that in this application, following all the photos of the property, there is information on the DaVinci slate roofs at the top of the page, Elite's attached estimate of \$24,394.00 for installation, materials and labor for architectural shingles. The following sentence states "This price is substantially lower than that of slate or synthetic slate, using the same measure and equation, the price for installation of synthetic slate would be a minimum of \$27,900.00. Lori further stated that, if synthetic slates are in the ballpark of \$27,900, the price is awfully close to the price of those architectural shingles. Much closer than Lori expected it to be. If that is accurate and something Elite can do, it would be worth the cost.

The applicant obtained the \$27,900 estimate based on her own online research. She asked if she should come back to the Commission after she obtained an estimate on the synthetic slate roof from Elite. Billy Joe responded that it would be preferable if it could be done in a timely manner. Ken Sullivan asked the applicant to raise the question with Elite concerning the fish scale pattern in an alternating pattern in the synthetic slate.

Lori asked how the Commission suggested the matter of the ridge lines / ridge caps be handled. Ken Sullivan asked the applicant to also ask the roofer what options were available for the ridge caps.

MOTION AND VOTE

The motion was made by Adam Krason, seconded by Lisa Fisher Casto and unanimously passed by the Commission 4-0 to approve the gutter and table the roof replacement.

Report on Minor Work Permits

26 Bradford St: Replace 2 double-hung, 1 over 1 windows on rear façade with vinyl. Exterior to be painted to match trim.

1516 Kanawha Blvd, East: Replace rear stairs.

2020 Kanawha Blvd, East: Replace windows on accessory structure with vinyl windows. Not visible from the street.

1527 Quarrier Street: Repair/replace in like kind decorative ridge caps.

1601 Virginia Street, East: Install vents to prevent water damage on enclosed porch. Will match the background against which it is placed.

Fort Scammon Stabilization

Project Updates

Planning Department Annual Report Review

Approval of Minutes of the February 17, 2022 and March 3, 2022 Meetings

On the motion of Ken Sullivan, seconded by Lisa Fisher Casto, the Commission unanimously approved the minutes of the February 17, 2022 and March 3, 2022 meetings.

Adjournment.

