



**JOURNAL of the PROCEEDINGS
of the
CITY COUNCIL**

CITY OF CHARLESTON, WEST VIRGINIA

Regular Meeting – Monday, January 3, 2022

at 7:00 P.M.

Council Chamber – City Hall – Charleston, West Virginia

OFFICIAL RECORD

Amy Shuler Goodwin
Mayor

Miles C. Cary II
City Clerk

CALL TO ORDER*

The Council met at 7:00 P.M., for the first meeting in the month of January on the 3rd day, in the year 2022, and was called to order by the Honorable Mayor, Amy Shuler Goodwin. The invocation was delivered by Councilmember Campbell, and the Pledge of Allegiance was led by Councilmember Pharr. The Honorable Clerk, Miles C. Cary II, called the roll of members and it was found that there were present at the time:

ADAMS**BURTON****COOK****HOOVER****KING****PEPPER****SNODGRASS****BAYS****CAMPBELL****FAEGRE****JENKINS****KNAUFF****MOORE****PERSINGER****ROBINSON****STEELE****BROWN****CEPERLEY****HAAS****JONES****MCKINNEY****OVERSTREET****PHARR****SHEETS****MAYOR GOODWIN**

With twenty-five members being present, the Mayor declared a quorum present.

Pending the reading of the Journal of the previous meeting, the reading thereof was dispensed with and the same duly approved.

PUBLIC SPEAKERS

1. Melinda Hamwi – Spoke about CKHA, TM Management, Sadd Brothers and WOWK-13 News.
2. Eric Desmond – Spoke about Sadd LLC., CHHA and TM Management.
3. Kenneth Hale – Spoke about lack of property demolition.

CLAIMS

None

STATE OF THE CITY

Mayor Goodwin gave the State of the City Address:

Members of Council, members of the administration, our outstanding City employees, and citizens of this Capital City:

It has become almost customary in any address of this sort to offer platitudes, overly optimistic projections, and generally a view through rose-colored glasses. I'm not here to do that tonight. If anything, the last 672 days of this pandemic have taught us that tomorrow—everything can change. But there are real, tangible, objectively verifiable reasons why I can stand before you tonight and say the state of our City is strong and poised for a brighter tomorrow.

I want to start with what we've accomplished—together—with residents of this Capital City and City Council. Before we do, let's remember those who left us far too soon. The late Councilman John Kennedy Bailey made our city brighter. He made us better. And, he left a distinguished legacy we will continue to build upon. Captain James David Byrd spent his life running into fires and saving lives as a 22-year veteran of the Charleston Fire Department and worked vaccination clinics to keep all of us safe.

And we mourn the residents of this city, of this county and across the country who lost their fight with COVID. It's still a fight for so many people tonight. Our hospitals are overrun. Our heroic front-line workers are tired. Health care professionals have clearly told us that over the next six weeks another dreadful surge is imminent.

If there is one thing we can do for each other, for our community, for our children, and for our grandparents—get the vaccine. And if you have, get the booster. We have a choice to help one another in the most monumental way. It is one of the greatest gifts we could give one another.

“Coming together is a beginning; keeping together is progress; working together is success.”

It was clear when Henry Ford said these words, he knew that he alone could not make positive change—without partnerships. This year because of our strong partnerships and relationships—we have succeeded. And it is because the 26 council members here in this chamber wanted better for our citizens. I want to thank each one of our council members for their hard work, and their commitment to this city and her people.

Indeed, actions speak louder than words, and in that vein, I want to share with you that in the throes of a pandemic, we again balanced the FY2022 budget with no new taxes, and without cutting or eliminating essential City services. Unlike other cities across the country, we did not eliminate any positions or make cuts to overtime—that includes police, fire, streets, and refuse. And—we have created and maintained the largest rainy-day fund in the City's history.

This past year has been challenging, but we have continued to prioritize infrastructure improvements with a focus on safety within our communities. We've kept our promise to keep

up with more paving and sidewalk projects—including adding more parking spaces for the South Hills shops and more street parking around the mall on Court Street. And trust me, if MacCorkle were a city street, it would have already been paved. However, we have a promise from our friends at the State Division of Highways that it will be paved this spring and summer. I know you will join me in keeping our eyes and ears open for those paving trucks.

We've made massive upgrades to our Downtown City-owned parking garages including new security cameras, additional lighting, updated paint schemes to more easily find your vehicle, and additional security presence on the evening and weekends.

This year alone we completed 17 new permanent public art installations—making our Capital City home to more than 375 permanent works.

In conjunction with the Charleston Police Department, the City's Street Department has been conducting an audit of lighting on the West Side, and we are ready to unveil a plan with our engineers to provide a safer way to connect the historic Five Corners.

We continue to invest in our small businesses throughout Charleston by offering small business grant funds. More than \$750,000 have helped our businesses make much needed improvements and helped to keep doors open and lights on.

And we invested in our kids. Ten years after the Summer Job Program ended, we brought it back. We gave more than 40 local kids a job—and they were great! Participants were matched with City departments including Public Works and Parks and Recreation and outside businesses.

Over the past three years, we have taken down more than 275 dilapidated and abandoned houses. These structures bring down the morale of a neighborhood and the value of properties.

We've also expanded our reach with the Charleston Land Reuse Agency's efforts to strategically develop and revitalize neighborhoods across our city. We continue to work with our federal, state, and local law enforcement partners to clean up our streets. Alongside our partners, we have taken down some of the worst drug dealers peddling poison on our streets. At the same time, we have deployed one of the best-modeled quick response teams in the state to identify and help those suffering from addiction—because it is not enough to attack the supply of drugs, we also must reduce the demand.

Our family reunification project continues to help people who have lost their way back to their families. Every day our CARE Office, members of the Charleston Police Department and the Charleston Fire Department alongside countless community services providers do all they can to get folks on a better path forward.

But as we have stated before, saying that systems are broken is not an accurate way to tell the story of what's happening. It is not the fault of a few bad people or a few people unwilling to help. It is the fault of decades of neglect and the unwillingness to effectively deal with issues surrounding mental health, substance use and homelessness. Working with local advocates, we

sent to the state house seven key pieces of legislation and programs aimed at providing additional resources for people in active addiction, those experiencing homelessness and folks needing mental health support—as well as preventative measures and recruitment of health care workers.

We were thrilled to see that recently the State committed more financial resources to local communities and our workforce on the front lines. And yes, these federal, state, and local law enforcement partnerships are critical. We know the best way to make our communities as safe as possible is to work directly with our communities. We are seeing this model work throughout our city and especially in Kanawha City where residents of the community and local business leaders have come together to work on making their community safe, and vibrant.

In 2020 we implemented a \$2,000 salary increase for all city employees including police and fire. And recently, with the unanimous consent of council, we gave our police officers a much-needed raise. This increase, paired with the across the board pay raise, means the average pay for a CPD officer has increased \$4,000 over the last 16 months. In addition to the pay increases for officers, we raised the starting salary for all probationary police officers almost \$2 per hour and we fixed a long-time pay issue for officers working night shift. These steps, in addition to a new \$15,000 signing bonus for first-time certified recruits, will help the Charleston Police Department be competitive in its ability to recruit and retain the best officers.

We know recruitment of emergency services personnel will be key over the next several years. That is why, working with the Charleston Fire Department, we created a \$15,000 signing bonus for qualifying, first-time recruits who are certified paramedics. And our work will continue with our Police and Fire departments to ensure recruiting is a top priority in the coming years. We also fixed a pay discrepancy for our Street Department CDL drivers. As part of a 2016 city-wide compensation study, certain positions were reclassified to lower starting hourly rates. Street Department drivers were downgraded two pay levels lower than Refuse Department drivers. This created a \$1.05 per hour disparity between two positions with similar job requirements. We fixed that. Now, drivers doing similar work are being paid the same.

Just last month we were awarded a \$1.75 million-dollar federal grant—the RAISE grant from the U.S. Department of Transportation. This grant will help us revitalize our waterfront. The Charleston Capital Connector Project will transform the Kanawha Boulevard corridor along the riverfront from Magic Island to the 35th Street bridge, make Greenbrier Street a true gateway to our community, and better connect the West Side and the East End to downtown. This grant will fund full planning, design, and engineering to get the project shovel-ready for construction.

Dozens of local partners came together to support us including business organizations, and neighborhood associations. But make no mistake, without the robust support of our United States senators—Senator Joe Manchin and Senator Shelley Moore Capito—the West Virginia Division of Highways and the Federal Highway Administration along with their leadership teams this opportunity would not have been possible, and we thank them.

Because of our strong relationships and partnerships not only in the city but across the state, Charleston is now part of the \$500-thousand dollar winning application in Phase 1 of the EDA's Build Back Better Regional Challenge. Out of 529 national applicants, our ACT Now Coalition was selected as just one of 60 and awarded money to compete in phase 2 of the grant process. The EDA will award only 20-30 coalitions out of the 60 up to \$100 million each. We believe strongly because of our partners who are with us in this project—including the City of Huntington, Coalfield Development Corporation, West Virginia University, Marshall University, the West Virginia Community Development Hub, The Nature Conservancy, Generation West Virginia, and Advantage Valley—we have an incredible shot. This project...this opportunity is one of the most exciting economic development projects we have worked on in this City in over a decade.

The McGee Foundation, a charity based in Charleston, committed \$250,000 for the creation of a master plan to improve the lives of all people living and working on the West Side of Charleston. This Foundation is doing things the right way—by partnering with the City to build plans through conversations with community groups and residents of the West Side. The Foundation has committed to us a partnership for the next 10-15 years to help make life better for our residents and increase the vitality of the neighborhood by addressing issues including housing, jobs, social services, and food access. We are so grateful for the McGee Foundation's commitment to the West Side, and we are grateful to Steve Kawash who is helping lead this charge.

Earlier this year we partnered with AT&T through their Believe Appalachia program. The leadership and the members of AT&T knew how hard our first responders were working—especially during this pandemic—and they wanted to help. Knowing there is nothing more valuable to a firefighter and a medic than a few good hours of sleep after working all night—AT&T provided new mattresses for all the fire stations. I know I speak for all the firefighters and medics when I say to AT&T employees, and to President Andy Feeney—Thank you.

Partnering with the Charleston Area Alliance and Charleston Convention & Visitors Bureau, we established the Charleston Roots program—a program designed to encourage and support families who want to establish or reestablish their roots in Charleston. The response has been overwhelming. These folks represent highly skilled individuals who also want to give back to our community. Over 150 applications from 35 different states and 4 countries were submitted. As a result, we have 14 new families living in our community or on their way—families who just needed a small window of opportunity to put down their roots and join our community.

The Charleston Coliseum & Convention Center is a showpiece in our Capital City. The \$100 million in renovations made it competitive with other facilities throughout the country. But, as we have said, building a facility and filling it are two different things. Our new partnership with OVG this past year has proven incredibly successful. OVG's wealth of industry knowledge and relationships with sales and booking agencies across the county and around the world have already secured a major return on investment for both the Coliseum and Convention Center and the Municipal Auditorium. From shows like Judas Priest, Jason Aldean, Ja Rule & Ashanti, Jeff Foxworthy—and those are just the ones that begin with the letter "J"—to large conventions hosting visitors for days to the return of The Basketball Tournament, we are quickly joining the ranks of other successfully managed venues across the country. Thanks to those who are

making great things happen at the Charleston Coliseum & Convention Center and the Municipal Auditorium.

And we brought baseball back with our new relationship with the Atlantic League—and our team—the Charleston Dirty Birds. Our team worked extremely hard to ensure baseball continued its long history in the Capital City. And they are making history. In their first season, despite having just three weeks to put together a team, the Dirty Birds made the playoffs and delivered one of the most dramatic playoff wins in Charleston history. After an amazingly successful first season, we look forward to what they will do this coming season and into the future.

One of my favorite authors and scholars of urban studies is Eric Klinenberg, who wrote the book “Places for the People”. Klinenberg, said...

“People forge bonds in places that have healthy social infrastructures...because when people engage in sustained, recurrent interaction, particularly while doing things they enjoy, relationships inevitably grow.”

How true that is.

I am proud of what we accomplished together though the social infrastructures we built and renovated together. We’re on the cusp of restoring vibrancy to our City’s center. Our new City Center at Slack Plaza will act as a central hub—one that is home to KRT, food trucks, live entertainment, ice skating, children’s programming and so much more.

And, as an added bonus, our new outdoor facility will allow us to enhance what became an incredibly popular downtown attraction this holiday season—Holly Jolly Brawley Walkway. The development of our City Center also brought us the City’s very first Business Improvement District where local businesses and property owners have taken an active role in helping to fund and develop programming around their investments.

We just recently announced and unveiled plans for the renovation of Celebration Station. We heard from the students on the East End from Piedmont Elementary including 4th grader Jackson White who talked about how he was tired of getting splinters on the playground. Through our partnership with The Greater Kanawha Valley Foundation, Charleston Rotary and Kanawha County Schools, we made a commitment to Jackson—and his friends: no more splinters.

The City of Charleston was also thrilled to have been chosen as the location for an AARP FitLot Fitness Park on Charleston’s East End at the Dixie Street Park—the only location in the State of West Virginia. The equipment installed with this project and programming along with other enhancements we made including a splash pad, swings, and a walking track will support healthy living for those in our community.

Downtown at the Martin Luther King Junior Center we unveiled new basketball, futsal and pickleball courts. And just a few weeks ago, we were honored to dedicate the western wing of the center, where our afterschool programs are held, to local Charleston hero, Patrolman Robert Edward Easley, Sr.

The West Side will see a brand-new park—one the community has requested for quite some time. The Beatrice Street location will host basketball courts, a playground, seating, and parking. You can walk to this park, ride your bike, take your car or ride the bus.

We opened Emma's Place, a dog park in honor of the late Patrolman Cassie Johnson, at Cato Park. The park will honor her and honor one of the things she loved most in this world—her beloved chocolate lab Emma.

And, we honored Bailee Rose Dunlap, by renovating the park on South Park Road in Kanawha City and naming it in her honor. She lost her fight with childhood cancer. She played at the park, across from her house, as she was courageously fighting this disease. Bailee Rose Dunlap loved that park—and now every child who reads the sign when they come to play will know who she was and that she loved this special place.

Our kids have told us they wanted a place to play—and we delivered. The new Charleston Skatepark is now one of the most used public parks in the entire city. It's packed daily with kids—and quite a few adults honing their skills and connecting with one another. Cato Park will not just be a place for golfers to play a quick 9-holes, but now disc golf will be available, along with new walking trails and pump track that are being built as we speak.

Families and visitors are already enjoying the new Spring Hill Cemetery Arboretum, the largest Arboretum in the State of West Virginia. Thank you to the Ratrie Family and the Friends of Spring Hill Cemetery Park and Arboretum for their dedication to this project.

I believe, just like Eric Klinenberg, that social infrastructure can help fight inequality, polarization, and the decline of civic life. We have made our city more inviting both for our fellow citizens and those who are looking for a new place to call home.

In Proverbs it says, *"where there is no vision the people shall perish."* I'm thankful to work with amazing city directors, members of this administration, and our city council members—all who have incredible vision for the city we love. Because we all have a vision of a Charleston where more people feel like they belong—to live, to work, to raise families.

A vision for a safe, vibrant city with robust amenities.

A vision that brings with it a plan of action that provides opportunities for all children.

A vision that invests in our small businesses and delivers good-paying jobs.

While we started that vision two years ago when we created our strategic plan of action—a plan that focused on fiscal responsibility, public safety, investment in small business and investment in critical infrastructure...

...we now have the tremendous opportunity this year to expand upon what we have done—in part—with the City's \$36.8 million allocation of the American Rescue Plan (ARP funds).

These American Rescue Plan funds represent a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity for the City of Charleston to invest in our economy and communities now, while also ensuring a bright future for generations to come. We hosted listening sessions last April and May, read hundreds of emails, scoured countless past and current city plans and have broken our plan into three major buckets:

- Economic Recovery,
- Healthy and Safe Communities, and
- Investing in Our City's Future.

Our plan moving forward must include keeping a steady hand on not only our finances but on our efforts to keep our communities healthy and safe during this continued pandemic.

Vaccination and testing events and maintaining critical supplies for our first responders are paramount and quite simply the fastest way to have our schools, businesses and lives free of so many of the constraints we currently face with COVID.

We will help support programs that house the homeless, we will invest in organizations that provide eviction relief to keep people in their homes, and we will support the shelters who open their doors to those in need. We will support housing opportunities that help grow our housing stock for our families. We will continue our daily fight to support those suffering from addiction through our CARE Office and with the assistance of local providers.

We will invest in new business incentives, and tourism incentives including events that bring a large return on investment.

We will turf fields, make necessary upgrades to existing pools, and invest in more summer job opportunities and childcare programming so our kids will continue to have a safe place to play.

We will keep building up our communities and families by helping to establish better food security, clear more dilapidated houses and structures, and commission a feasibility study and design for a new public safety center.

We will continue our work helping our small businesses by developing a more substantial way of helping them—including the creation of a small business liaison and continuing the small business investment grants.

And we will work to improve our process with this council with a top to bottom review of our policies, and procedures, so we are always accountable and transparent to those who have elected us to serve on their behalf.

We have so much to look forward to in the year ahead of us. And I'm not just talking about the return of the Regatta.

I know we are all entering this year with:

...*renewed hope* for healing of those who are suffering,
...with *passion* so we may continue our work making positive change for all neighborhoods and businesses,
...and with the *excitement* that we will be joined by another outstanding Youth Council who will help us develop and execute good government through good policy focused on the next generation.

So as this body certainly knows, we have all been busy—because again, we know that actions speak louder than words.

We welcome this new year and the opportunities it brings for us to continue to make Charleston a place to belong.

Thank you.

PROCLAMATIONS

None

COMMUNICATIONS

None

REPORTS OF COMMITTEES

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

Councilmember Jenkins, Chair of the Council Committee on Finance, submitted the following reports:

1. Your committee on Finance has had under consideration the following resolution, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Resolution No. 583-22 be adopted.

Resolution No. 583-22 - Whereas, in recognition of the complex legal, spending, and reporting requirements that come with allocating the City of Charleston's American Rescue Plan Act ("ARPA") funds, the City Council finds it necessary to hire an established and qualified accounting firm to facilitate, monitor, and track the City's forthcoming ARPA program;

Whereas, on August 23, 2021, the City issued a nation-wide solicitation seeking proposals from qualified firms to provide accounting and advisory services;

Whereas, the City received 12 proposals from interested firms, and an evaluation committee was established that included the Council President, City Manager, City Attorney, City Finance Director, and Interim City Auditor;

Whereas, the evaluation committee shortlisted 4 firms for further consideration, and after conducting interviews, scored BDO USA, LLP, highest among the shortlisted firms and recommended negotiating the terms of service;

Whereas, the evaluation committee took special note of the fact that BDO has provided (and continues to provide) accounting services to the State of West Virginia relating to CARES Act and ARPA federal funding and is well-acquainted with applicable West Virginia laws concerning public expenditures;

Whereas, BDO has agreed to perform the following services: assist with funding eligibility determinations, evaluate expenditure tracking systems, review internal policies and procedures, conduct grant compliance reviews (both internal and sub-recipient), and prepare obligatory reporting during the existence of the City's ARPA program;

Whereas, BDO has proposed hourly rates that average 60% lower than its standard rates; and

Whereas, the Administration recommends awarding the contract to BDO under the negotiated

terms.

Now, therefore, be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to enter into a contract with BDO USA, LLP, to perform accounting services relating to the administration of the City's American Rescue Plan Act funding distribution, where the contract amount may not exceed \$500,000. The City Manager is directed to provide notice to the Finance Committee each instance when the total expenditures under the contract exceed a denomination of \$100,000.

Councilmember Jenkins added that the resolution is the result of a lengthy process wherein a Selection Committee conducted a nation-wide search to help with the accounting services related to the administration of the ARPA funds. These Federal funds require that strict guidelines be followed, that in part require quarterly expenditure reports. The contract will allow the City will allow the City to act swiftly once it decides how to spend the APRA funds. Councilmember Jenkins added that he was initially concerned about the amount and why an internal grant coordinator couldn't do this work. However, the City has posted a position for this three times (with plans to post again), but have not been able to find someone yet. The CDBG funds of \$2 million have three people assigned to tracking them, and these funds are for \$38 million. Councilmember Jenkins added that this will ensure the City does it correctly the first time, and does not have to risk paying back the funds later.

Councilmember Persinger added that the item was related to APRA funds, so it should have to go through that Committee. Councilmember Persinger moved that Resolution No. 583-22 be referred to the American Rescue Plan Act Advisory Committee. Councilmember Snodgrass seconded.

A roll call was taken:

YEAS: Burton, Campbell, Faegre, Haas, Jones, Knauff, McKinney, Moore, Overstreet, Persinger, Snodgrass

NAYS: Adams, Bays, Brown, Ceperley, Cook, Hoover, Jenkins, King, Pepper, Pharr, Robinson, Sheets, Steele, Mayor Goodwin

ABSENT: Minardi, Reishman

With members present recorded thereon as voting in the majority in the affirmative, with fourteen (14) Yeas and eleven (11) Nays, the Mayor declared the motion to refer Resolution No. 583-22 to the American Rescue Plan Act Advisory Committee as not passed.

Councilmember Snodgrass added that she had a problem with the limit of spending being up to \$100,000, but the State Auditor Officer, through Project Mountaineer, could have been enacted

at no cost. That would have accomplished a large percentage of the resolution. Councilmember Snodgrass added that the resolution was unnecessary.

Councilmember Jenkins added that the Auditor's online portal doesn't have any impact in terms of the reporting that is required. Is it actually an online portal that allows the public to see how the funds are being spent, which is already a requirement that that information will be on the Auditor's Portal. There are also other requirements that the consultant will help the City meet. BDO is already working with the State, so they are already very familiar with the rules. Councilmember Jenkins added that the resolution doesn't have anything to do with putting other City finances on the Auditor's online portal. The consultant would be dealing with the Federal and State requirements that the portal does not address.

Councilmember Faegre asked if the consultant was selected primarily because the State is using their services. Councilmember Jenkins replied that there were various factors that were considered including their presentation as compared to other applicants, their ability to address the City's concerns, etc. Councilmember Faegre asked if other municipalities are using the Auditor's Office instead of a consultant. Councilmember Jenkins replied that everyone, including Charleston, will be using the Auditor's Office. It also depends on the complexity and amount of funds that are to be used. For example, the city of Clendenin has decided to use their comparatively smaller amount on one funding, which makes the tracking and reporting of that project much simpler when multiple projects and larger expenditures are involved. Councilmember Faegre asked if no one in the State was qualified.

Councilmember Ceperley added that the consultant will deal with the transparency in what the City has decided to do with the funds (which will involve the Auditor's Office), and the other is tracking all of the money, sub-money and compliance to the requirements.

Councilmember Snodgrass added that surely there would be a company within the State who could offer similar services and/or hiring in-house CPAs. Councilmember Snodgrass added that some municipalities are using the proposed consultant for this purpose, but are smaller cities that do not have enough staff. Most of the larger cities are doing most of the work in-house. City Manager, Jonathan Storage, added a West Virginia firm was one of the finalists, however, when the entire picture was taken into account (timeline, references, specific experiences, etc.), BDO won contract due to their ability and experience to handle this specific CARES Act and APRA funding. The Auditor's web site will track every dollar of APRA spending, but the consultant will ensure that the funds are being spent in accordance with the guidelines as well as ensure and track that any beneficiaries adhere to any agreement that the City enters into with them. Storage added that it is an on-call agreement, so the City will only be paying for the services it needs. Once the vacant position is filled, the City will be able to scale back its reliance on an outside consultant.

Councilmember Persinger added that the Auditor's Office does offer these same services as the consultant. He added that the State Auditor does not audit anything on the State level, only counties and cities. Councilmember Persinger added that he had introduced a bill (Clerk's note: actually Resolution No. 570-21) that is directly linked to this discussion. Storage replied that while the State Auditor has offered their support in any way they can, but not at the level of oversight they have been discussing. Additionally, the State Auditor's Office does not have the capacity to handle the volume of transactions that would be required. For example, the City is required to go through a yearly, financial audit. The City hires an outside firm for this because the State does not have the capacity to do all municipal audits. Councilmember Persinger added that the State will do the City's audit for free if it is requested. Storage replied that the State would charge a fee for such an audit.

Councilmember King added that the Mayor has the discretion to refer any bill or resolution to any Committee that they see as appropriate. The Committee Chairs then choose when to meet, etc.

Councilmember McKinney inquired as to the status of the American Rescue Plan Act Advisory Committee and Resolution No. 570-21. Councilmember Jenkins replied that two different things are being discussed. Resolution No. 570-21 deals with the State Auditor's transparency online portal that links to the Enterprise Accounting Software used by the City to track the payments of funds to various vendors. Resolution No. 570-21 proposes to link all of the City's finances in addition to the ARPA funds. Councilmember Jenkins added that he is in favor of that. The resolution on the floor specifically addresses ARPA funds that is part of transparency and accountability. Councilmember Jenkins added that there are significant rules and regulations attached to this federal funding. The proposed consultant will be knowledgeable of the significant treasury regulations requiring quarterly expenditure reports for all sub-grants. While he would prefer for this to be done in-house, the City has not yet been able to fill that position despite multiple attempts. Councilmember Jenkins added that the resolution on the floor is for the reporting, requirements, accountability and tracking of the ARPA funds. This is separate for the transparency of Resolution No. 570-21. Additionally, there will be transparency for the ARPA funds already through the State Auditor's web site as required. Councilmember McKinney stated that she has not heard anything about the ARPA Committee or Persinger's resolution. Mayor Goodwin replied that the American Rescue Plan Act Advisory Committee has been meeting and posting meetings since early 2021. A report of the application process was given to all Councilmembers. The applications were online from October 2021 to December 15, 2021. Councilmember McKinney asked why Resolution No. 570-21 hasn't gone to Committee. Councilmember Jenkins added that Resolution No. 570-21 has nothing to do with reporting to the Treasury and the various tracking obligations, which is what the resolution on the floor addresses.

Councilmember Persinger asked why Resolution No. 570-21, which has to do with ARPA funds,

was referred to American Rescue Plan Act Advisory and Finance Committees. Why would the resolution on the floor not also need to go to the American Rescue Plan Act Advisory Committee as well? Councilmember Jenkins replied that Councilmember King's earlier comments would answer that question.

Councilmember Pharr asked how many times the American Rescue Plan Act Advisory Committee has met. Mayor Goodwin replied approximately four or five. Initially, there were eleven members appointed. Councilmember Pharr asked if any other Councilmembers not on the Committee attended those meetings. Mayor Goodwin replied that they would need to check the records to be able to answer accurately. Councilmember Pharr added that there have been countless opportunities in Committee meetings to bring in advisors and discuss topics before they are brought to full Council. The work is done in Committee meetings, and there seems to be a lot of confusion when things come before Council. She asked why aren't these things being brought up and discussed in Committee meetings.

Councilmember Robinson added that the Committee had been meeting for a while, noting that they were still holding meetings at the Convention center at the time. He added that the two resolutions have been confused on purpose, because they speak to two different things.

Councilmember Snodgrass added that it is apparent that if an item does not want to be heard, it gets dismissed into several Committees, never to be brought up. If Resolution No. 570-21 had already been heard, it would have answered a lot of questions that have come up.

Councilmember Knauff confirmed that the resolution on the floor was introduced that evening.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. A roll call was taken:

YEAS: Adams, Bays, Brown, Burton, Ceperley, Cook, Hoover, Jenkins, King, Moore, Overstreet, Pepper, Pharr, Robinson, Sheets, Steele, Mayor Goodwin

NAYS: Campbell, Faegre, Haas, Jones, Knauff, McKinney, Persinger, Snodgrass

ABSENT: Minardi, Reishman

With members present recorded thereon as voting in the majority in the affirmative, with seventeen (17) Yeas and eight (8) Nays, the Mayor declared Resolution No. 583-22 adopted.

REPORTS OF OFFICERS

1. Report of the City of Charleston Payroll Variance Analysis; December 2021.

NEW BILLS

Introduced by Councilmember Bobby Reishman

January 3, 2022:

Bill No. 7939 – A Bill amending the Zoning Ordinance to a R-0 district, that certain parcel of land located at 2922 Chesterfield Avenue in Kanawha City.

Refer to Municipal Planning Commission and Planning, Streets and Traffic Committee, Please

Introduced by Councilmember Ben Adams, Caitlin Cook, Courtney Persinger, Jennifer Pharr, Chad Robinson and Bobby Reishman

January 3, 2022:

Bill No. 7941 – A BILL approving the issuance of a cable television franchise with Community Antenna Service, Inc., doing business as CAS

Refer to Finance Committee, Please

Introduced by Councilmember Ben Adams, Caitlin Cook, Sam Minardi, Courtney Persinger, Jennifer Pharr, Chad Robinson and Bobby Reishman

January 3, 2022:

Bill No. 7942 – A BILL approving the renewal of a cable television franchise with Cebridge Acquisitions, LLC, doing business as Suddenlink Communications

Refer to Finance Committee, Please

MISCELLANEOUS/UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None

REMARKS BY MEMBERS

1. Councilmember Jones stated that Blaine Boulevard was still slipping and a safety hazard.
2. Councilmember Snodgrass stated that the State recently gave all employees a 5% raise and a 2.5% one-time bonus. Boone County gave their Sheriffs a \$2,400 bonus; Kanawha County gave a 4% increase and a \$3,000 bonus to their Deputies. Nitro gave all employees a \$500 one-time bonus. The Charleston Police Department continues to be understaffed. Councilmember Snodgrass added that 911 calls are increasing. After the \$1 raise was implemented, only seven people attending the last class, and only two qualified. Officer-involved shootings are averaging two/three per year. Councilmember Snodgrass added that their primary charge is to provide public safety.
3. Councilmember Ceperley stated that Councilmember Minardi has to miss this meeting due to a family illness. Councilmember Ceperley added that copies of Council Rules and several chapters from Mason's Manual of Legislative Procedure have been placed on Council desks.

ADJOURNMENT

The Clerk, Miles C. Cary II, called the closing roll call:

YEAS: Adams, Bays, Brown, Burton, Campbell, Ceperley, Cook, Faegre, Haas, Hoover, Jenkins, Jones, King, Knauff, McKinney, Moore, Overstreet, Pepper, Persinger, Pharr, Robinson, Sheets, Snodgrass, Steele, Mayor Goodwin

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Minardi, Reishman

At 8:34 p.m., by a motion from Councilmember Ceperley, Council adjourned until Tuesday, January 18, 2022, 7:00 p.m., in Council Chambers at City Hall.

Amy Shuler Goodwin, Honorable Mayor

Miles C. Cary II, City Clerk