



CITY OF CHARLESTON West Virginia



Council Member – 12th WARD

Joseph Jenkins
839 Gordon Drive
Charleston, West Virginia 25303
304-575-9202
joseph.jenkins@cityofcharleston.org

Finance Committee, Chair
Parking Committee, Chair
Public Safety Committee
Parks and Recreation Committee

AGENDA SELECT COMMITTEE ON INSURANCE AGENT RELATIONS – PROPERTY AND CASUALTY November 5, 2021 4:30 PM To be held over Zoom

***Join via internet:**

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/89525245057?pwd=NVIDeU93cWFQbUNZcVprY21XekE3Zz09>

Passcode: 033863

***Join via Telephone: (312) 626-6799 or (929) 436-2866**

Webinar ID: 895 2524 5057

APPROVAL OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

9-27-2021

DISCUSSION AND APPROVAL

To discuss and approve insurance carrier allocations among competing brokerage/agent/producer firms, as mutually agreed to by such firms.

ADJOURN

JJ/ns

MINUTES

SELECT COMMITTEE ON INSURANCE AGENT RELATIONS – PROPERTY AND CASUALTY

THE MEETING WAS HELD IN ROOM #308 OF CITY HALL, AND WAS ALSO MADE AVAILABLE TO
THE PUBLIC VIA ZOOM PER THE AGENDA.

6:00 P. M., SEPTEMBER 27, 2021

Joseph Jenkins, Vice Chairperson, called the meeting of the Select Committee on Insurance Agent Relations – Property and Casualty to order at 6:00p.m., September 27, 2021.

Committee Members Present:

Joseph Jenkins, Chair
Bobby Reishman
Becky Ceperley
Mary Beth Hoover
Adam Knauff
Jennifer Pharr
Shannon Snodgrass (over Zoom)

Members Absent:

None

A roll call was taken, and it was determined that a quorum was present.

1. Approval of the Previous minutes for July 15, September 13, September 14 and September 22, 2021.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to approve the previous minutes. With the members being present having voted in the unanimously as affirmative, the Chair declared the previous minutes as approved.

September 27, 2021

2. Scoring

Councilmember Jenkins stated that the Committee will be discussing the applicable scoring criteria. The Members have scoring sheets in order to help them score each of the four firms. Councilmember Jenkins added that it would be appropriate to enter into Executive Session since they will be discussing commercial competition, whose presentations were presented during Executive Session.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to move into Executive Committee. With the members being present having voted in the unanimously as affirmative, the Chair declared the Committee to be in Executive Session.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to end the Executive Session. With the members being present having voted unanimously in the affirmative, the Committee moved into Regular Session.

Councilmember Jenkins stated that each Member individually tabulated a score sheet for each firm based on the considerations that were within the Expressions of Interest. Each score will be averaged for "Implementation Services," "Experience & Qualifications" and a total average score from the seven Committee Members.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to recess for ten minutes to allow the Chair to calculate the results. There were no objections. Councilmember Reishman motioned to resume the meeting. There were no objections.

Councilmember Jenkins stated that the scores in order were:

1. USI – $49.4/42 = 91.4$
2. WVCoRP – $48.3/40.1 = 88.4$
3. RCM&D – $43.1/39.3 = 82.5$
4. AssuredPartners – $41.6/35.6 = 77.2$

Councilmember Jenkins added that the top three firms will go on to the next level to work with the City Manager's Office to return with insurance proposals. The Committee will need to decide the new scoring criteria will be developed.

City Manager, Jonathan Storage, suggested that he and his team draft scoring criteria for the Committee to then approve or change. His Office will notify the firms of the Committee's decision, adding that cost will be one of the predominant factors.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to approve the three firms of USI, WVCoRP and RCM&D as moving forward as stated in the Expression of Interest. With the members being present having voted unanimously in the affirmative, the Chair declared the three firms as approved.

Councilmember Snodgrass asked if the presentations would be in person. Councilmember Jenkins replied that there would not be a presentation, rather a submitted proposal, which will be scored by the Committee. Councilmember Snodgrass added that it would be nice to be able to ask questions. Councilmember Jenkins added that it was open for discussion, but he had pictured the Committee asking questions as needed, not necessarily having the firms there in person. Councilmember Reishman added that he would like to have the proposals first.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to adjourn the meeting.
Meeting adjourned.


September 27, 2021



CITY OF CHARLESTON
OFFICE OF THE CITY MANAGER

MEMORANDUM

TO: Select Committee on Insurance Agent Relations – Property & Casualty

FROM: Jonathan T. Storage, City Manager 

DATE: November 4, 2021

SUBJECT: Insurance Market Allocation

In order for the competing firms to represent the City of Charleston in the insurance marketplace, it is necessary to allocate the field of insurance carriers. This allocation is necessary because carriers are only willing to perform the due diligence required for providing a quote to one designated City representative per line of insurance coverage.

On Tuesday, November 2, 2021, Chairman Jenkins and I hosted a Zoom call with representatives of the competing firms, and the following market allocation was mutually agreed upon.

I submit this list for your consideration, and I recommend its approval.

MARKET ALLOCATION:

RCM&D – Old Republic Exclusive

- **Property / Excess Property:** Liberty, C N A, Zurich, AFM, AIG
- **B&M:** Liberty, C N A, Zurich, AFM, AIG
- **General Liability:** Liberty, Old Republic, Berkley, Chubb, AIG, Philadelphia
- **Auto:** Liberty, Philadelphia, Old Republic, Berkley, Chubb, AIG
- **Excess Work Comp:** Midwest
- **Crime markets:** Hanover, Zurich, Berkley, Chubb, Starr

- **Professional/Public Officials Liability Markets:** AXA XL (thru Professional Governmental Underwriters or any other source), AIG, Chubb, Great American
- **Law Enforcement Liability:** Liberty
- **Pollution:** Liberty / Ironshore, Philadelphia
- **Cyber:** Coalition, Corvus, CFC, Brit, Berkley, Tokio Marine, Canopius, Zurich, CAN, Liberty / Ironshore
- **Misc. Bonds:** Liberty, Zurich

USI – Travelers Exclusive

- **Property / Excess Property:** Brit, RPS-Munich Re, Hartford, Travelers, Westchester, Genesis and Alliant
- **B&M:** Hartford, Travelers
- **General Liability:** Brit, RPS-Munich Re, Safety National, Travelers, Genesis and Alliant
- **Auto:** Brit, RPS-Munich Re, Safety National, Travelers, Genesis and Alliant
- **Excess Work Comp:** Safety National, Liberty Mutual, Arch, Star, Genesis and Alliant
- **Crime markets:** Brit, RPS-Munich Re, Safety National, Travelers, Genesis and Alliant
- **Professional/Public Officials Liability Markets:** Brit, RPS-Munich Re, Safety National, Travelers, Genesis and Alliant
- **Law Enforcement Liability:** Brit, RPS-Munich Re, Safety National, Travelers, Genesis, and Alliant
- **Pollution:** Chubb, Crum Forster, Genesis and Alliant
- **Cyber:** Axis, Crum & Forster, AxaXL, Beazley, AIG, At Bay, Cowbell, Ascent
- **Misc. Bonds:** Travelers, Old Republic

WVCoRP

- **Pollution:** Nautilus¹

¹ Other than pollution coverage, the WVCoRP program wraps up all other lines of coverage within its internal program, so market allocation is not necessary for WVCoRP regarding other coverages.