



CITY OF CHARLESTON West Virginia



Council Member – 12th WARD

Joseph Jenkins
839 Gordon Drive
Charleston, West Virginia 25303
304-575-9202
joseph.jenkins@cityofcharleston.org

Finance Committee, Chair
Parking Committee, Chair
Parks and Recreation Committee

AGENDA SELECT COMMITTEE ON INSURANCE AGENT RELATIONS – PROPERTY AND CASUALTY September 27, 2021 6:00 PM COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 3RD FLOOR, CITY HALL

APPROVAL OF PREVIOUS MINUTES

- 7-15-2021
- 9-13-2021
- 9-14-2021
- 9-22-2021

OLD BUSINESS: DISCUSSION

- Discuss the applicable scoring criteria.
- Consider and discuss the various presentations offered by responding firms.

SCORING

- Each responding firm will be separately scored by individual committee members.
- The Chair will determine total average scores, where the average scores will constitute final scores.
- Approval of the final scores.
- Developing new scoring criteria for evaluating final insurance proposals and timeline for release.

ADJOURN

JJ/ns

*Meetings may be recorded and broadcast via internet <https://charlestonwv.civicclerk.com>

MINUTES

SELECT COMMITTEE ON INSURANCE AGENT RELATIONS – PROPERTY AND CASUALTY

THE MEETING WAS HELD IN THE AV ROOM AND WAS ALSO MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC VIA
ZOOM PER THE AGENDA.

5:00 P. M., JULY 15, 2021

Joseph Jenkins, Chairperson, called the meeting of the Select Committee on Insurance Agent Relations – Property and Casualty to order at 5:00p.m., July 15, 2021.

Committee Members Present:

Joseph Jenkins, Chair
Bobby Reishman (over Zoom)
Jennifer Pharr
Shannon Snodgrass (over Zoom)

Members Absent:

Will Laird
Adam Knauff
Mary Beth Hoover

A roll call was taken, and it was determined that a quorum was present.

July 15, 2021

1. Approval of Previous Minutes –

Councilmember Reishman asked for unanimous consent to dispense with the reading of the minutes for the July 1, 2021 meeting and that they be approved as distributed. There were no objections, and the minutes were approved.

2. Discussion to review and approve the Expression of Interest submitted by the City Manager –

Councilmember Jenkins stated that the submitted EOI was what he had envisioned.

City Manager, Jonathan Storage stated that he drafted an EIO that was as comprehensive as possible to show interested parties exactly what would be expected if they were chosen. It also points out that there will be multiple stages to the arrangement. The first round will be respondents showing that they are qualified to meet the needs of the City, and will not be scored. The Committee will then choose a number to interview, which will be scored. That evaluation criteria is listed in the EOI. Then, the top 3 or so will be invited to bring back their best proposals (which will be scored) to the Committee for its final decision. Storage noted that the pricing structure is listed as a fixed fee (as opposed to commission), in order to best prepare the municipal budget and take away incentives to up sale.

Councilmember Jenkins confirmed that the short list will then be narrowed to 5 or 3 candidates. He asked if there will be concerns that they will not be able to give the Committee costs at that point. Storage replied they could choose to take that into consideration. Since it will be a fixed fee, they would be asking them to quote their entire field of services so it would be like a consulting fee that should not be tied to relationships that they have in the insurance market. Storage added that he tried to account for that in the scoring system, with a higher weight for best insurance package. Councilmember Jenkins agreed with this when they evaluate the final round, but had concerns regarding the short list. Councilmember Snodgrass agreed as well considering the broker would not yet know the full details, and suggested leaving that out of the short list.

Councilmember Reishman was concerned as the cost could be a significant factor. Councilmember Snodgrass added that they will not be able to know that until the final round. Councilmember Jenkins clarified that once the final 3 are selected, there will be different evaluation criteria. At this point, cost is difficult to compare. Councilmember Jenkins suggested that the cost scoring be reduced to 10 or 15. Storage added that the Exhibit does provide a lot of detail, but he would be fine to remove it during the short list phase. Councilmember Pharr asked if that would affect the schedule of events. Storage replied that the schedule itself would not be altered. However, it would alter the scoring criteria. All of that would be due in February, which would give the Committee a month for review in order to bring their final decision to full Council in March.

July 15, 2021

Councilmember Snodgrass added that the EOI looked great. She would like to have it specify that the letters of reference come from current clients, perhaps municipalities. Councilmember Jenkins suggested that they could change it to require 3 current references, one of which is a municipality. The Committee agreed to remove the cost factor from the short list and do 55/45. Councilmember Jenkins asked if they wanted to raise the final number to 3 in case the Committee really liked more than 3. Storage added that it would be very difficult on the administration side to send out all of that data separately. He added that it is not a burden to have more interview candidates. Councilmember Snodgrass suggested 6.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to approve the amendments offered by the Committee. Councilmember Snodgrass seconded.

- Amend Section 3.1 to read “firms must submit 3 current client references, one of which must be a municipality.”
- Amend the first paragraph of Section 4.1 to read “no more than six firms.”
- Amend Section 4.2 to eliminate cost from the short list of evaluation criteria, and to increase the implementation services/experience qualifications criteria to 55/45 points.

With the members being present having voted unanimously as affirmative, the Chair declared the amendments approved.

Councilmember Pharr motioned to approve the Expression of Interest as Amended. Councilmember Reishman seconded. With the members being present having voted unanimously as affirmative, the Chair declared the Expression of Interest as Amended approved.

Councilmember Jenkins thanked Storage and Finance Director, Andy Wood. Councilmember Snodgrass asked if Storage was going to reach out to the brokers who represent similar municipalities. Storage replied that they will be on the mailing list. Additionally, they will publish the EOI on the City’s website, trade publications and national publications (New York Times, Washington Post, etc.).

The Committee decided they would not be a need to meet until they are ready to create a short list.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to adjourn the meeting.
Meeting adjourned.

MINUTES

SELECT COMMITTEE ON INSURANCE AGENT RELATIONS – PROPERTY AND CASUALTY

THE MEETING WAS HELD VIRTUALLY AND WAS MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC VIA ZOOM PER
THE AGENDA.

5:30 P. M., SEPTEMBER 13, 2021

Joseph Jenkins, Chairperson, called the meeting of the Select Committee on Insurance Agent Relations – Property and Casualty to order at 5:30p.m., September 13, 2021.

Committee Members Present:

Joseph Jenkins, Chair (over Zoom) (left around 5:55 pm)
Bobby Reishman (over Zoom)
Becky Ceperley (over Zoom)
Mary Beth Hoover (over Zoom)
Adam Knauff (over Zoom)
Jennifer Pharr (over Zoom)
Shannon Snodgrass (over Zoom)

Members Absent:

None

A roll call was taken, and it was determined that a quorum was present.

Councilmember Jenkins added that there will be 4 total presentations spread over several meetings. Three will be selected to come back with defined proposals.

1. USI will provide a presentation to the Select Committee regarding its response to the City's Request for Expressions of Interest.

Councilmember Ceperley motioned to move the Committee into Executive Session with representatives of USI. Councilmember Hoover seconded. With the members being present having voted unanimously in the affirmative, the Committee moved into Executive Session.

With no objections, a quorum of the Committee moved out of Executive Session into Regular Session.

Councilmember Hoover motioned to adjourn the meeting. Councilmember Pharr seconded.

Meeting adjourned.

September 13, 2021

MINUTES

SELECT COMMITTEE ON INSURANCE AGENT RELATIONS – PROPERTY AND CASUALTY

THE MEETING WAS HELD VIRTUALLY AND WAS MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC VIA ZOOM PER
THE AGENDA.

5:30 P. M., SEPTEMBER 14, 2021

Joseph Jenkins, Chairperson, called the meeting of the Select Committee on Insurance Agent Relations – Property and Casualty to order at 5:30p.m., September 14, 2021.

Committee Members Present:

Joseph Jenkins, Chair (over Zoom)

Bobby Reishman (over Zoom) (left at approximately 7)

Becky Ceperley (over Zoom)

Mary Beth Hoover (over Zoom)

Adam Knauff (over Zoom) (not present for 1st executive session vote)

Jennifer Pharr (over Zoom)

Shannon Snodgrass (over Zoom)

Members Absent:

None

A roll call was taken, and it was determined that a quorum was present.

Councilmember Jenkins added that there will be 4 total presentations spread over several meetings. Three will be selected to come back with defined proposals.

1. RCM&D will provide a presentation to the Select Committee regarding its response to the City's Request for Expressions of Interest.

Councilmember Hoover motioned to move the Committee into Executive Session with representatives of RCM&D. Councilmember Reishman seconded. With the members being present having voted unanimously in the affirmative, the Committee moved into Executive Session.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to end the Executive Session with representatives of RCM&D. With the members being present having voted unanimously in the affirmative, the Committee moved into Regular Session.

September 14, 2021

2. WVCoRP will provide a presentation to the Select Committee regarding its response to the City's Request for Expressions of Interest.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to move the Committee into Executive Session with representatives of WVCoRP. With the members being present having voted unanimously in the affirmative, the Committee moved into Executive Session.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to end the Executive Session with representatives of WVCoRP. With the members being present having voted unanimously in the affirmative, the Committee moved into Regular Session.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to adjourn the meeting.
Meeting adjourned.

September 14, 2021

MINUTES

SELECT COMMITTEE ON INSURANCE AGENT RELATIONS – PROPERTY AND CASUALTY

THE MEETING WAS HELD VIRTUALLY AND WAS MADE AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC VIA ZOOM PER
THE AGENDA.

5:30 P. M., SEPTEMBER 22, 2021

Bobby Reishman, Vice Chairperson, called the meeting of the Select Committee on Insurance Agent Relations – Property and Casualty to order at 5:30p.m., September 22, 2021.

Committee Members Present:

Bobby Reishman (over Zoom)
Becky Ceperley (over Zoom)
Mary Beth Hoover (over Zoom)
Adam Knauff (over Zoom)
Jennifer Pharr (over Zoom)
Shannon Snodgrass (over Zoom)

Members Absent:

Joseph Jenkins, Chair

A roll call was taken, and it was determined that a quorum was present.

1. AssuredPartners will provide a presentation to the Select Committee regarding its response to the City's Request for Expressions of Interest.

Councilmember Knauff motioned to move the Committee into Executive Session with representatives of AssuredPartners. Councilmember Hoover seconded. With the members being present having voted unanimously in the affirmative, the Committee moved into Executive Session.

Councilmember Ceperley motioned to end the Executive Session with representatives of Assured Partners. Councilmember Knauff seconded. With the members being present having voted unanimously in the affirmative, the Committee moved into Regular Session.

Councilmember Ceperley motioned to adjourn the meeting. Councilmember Knauff seconded.

September 22, 2021

Meeting adjourned.