MINUTES
FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
6:30 P.M., JULY 6, 2020
A/V CONFERENCE ROOM*

Joseph Jenkins, Chairperson, called the meeting of the Charleston City Council Committee on Finance to order at 6:30 p.m., July 6, 2020, in the Audio/Visual Room in City Hall*.

A silent roll was taken by the Clerk and a quorum was established. The following committee members were present:

Joseph Jenkins, Chair
Bobby Reishman, Vice Chair
Ben Adams
Brent Burton
Becky Ceperley
Mary Beth Hoover
Will Laird

*In response to the COVID-19 pandemic, the meeting of the Finance Committee was conducted electronically. The meeting was made available to the public as a live stream via Zoom and CivicClerk (per the agenda).

I. DISCUSSION:

a. Approval of Previous Minutes - Councilmember Reishman asked for unanimous consent to dispense with the reading of the minutes for the June 15, 2020 meeting and that they be approved as distributed. There was no objection and the minutes were approved.

II. RESOLUTIONS:

a. Resolution No. 350-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase Bituminous Concrete (asphalt) from WV Paving, Inc. on an as needed basis at $76.50 per ton for Wearing Course Material Type 1; and $73.25 per ton for Patching and Leveling Material Type 1 to be used by the Public Works Department, as the result of a competitive bidding process.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase Bituminous Concrete (asphalt) on an as needed basis at $76.50 per ton for Wearing Course Material Type 1; and $73.25 per ton for Patching and Leveling Material Type 1 to be used by the Public Works Department, as the result of a competitive bidding process.

City Manager, Jonathan Storage, added that the City Manager's Office opened bids for bituminous concrete (asphalt) on an as needed based to be used by the City's Street Department. One vendor submitted a bid: West Virginia Paving, Inc., of Dunbar, WV. The bid prices are per ton and per type of material ordered.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution No. 350-20 approved.

Bituminous Concrete for Public Works Project No. 2020-014 Bid Opening: June 24, 2020 @ 11:00am			
	WV Paving, Inc. 2950 Charles Avenue Dunbar, WV 25064 P: (304) 768-9733 rjohnson@wvpaving.com		
Wearing Course Material Type I, Item 401-2-1	$76.50 per ton		
Patching and Leveling Type I, Item 401-3-1	$73.25 per ton		
Successful Bidder	✓		

b. Resolution No. 351-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase Portland Cement (concrete) from Hanson Ready Mix to be used by the Public Works Department on an as needed basis at the prices listed on the attached tabulation sheet, as the result of a competitive bidding process.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase Portland Cement (concrete) from Hanson Ready Mix to be used by the Public Works Department on an as needed basis at the prices listed on the attached tabulation sheet, as the result of a competitive bidding process.

Storage added that the City Manager's Office opened bids for Portland cement on an as needed based to be used by the City's Street Department. One vendor submitted a bid: Hanson Ready Mix of Vienna, West Virginia.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution No. 351-20 approved.

Portland Cement Concrete for Public Works			
Project No. 2020-16			
Bid Opening: June 24, 2020 @ 11:00am			
	Hanson Ready Mix		
	1105 9th Street		
	Vienna, WV 26105		
	P: (304) 485-2191		
	Bradley.Rucker@lehighhanson.com		
(a) Full Load (unload in 30 minutes or less), per cubic yard, delivered to job site:			
Class A 3500# Concrete	$136.00		
Class B 3500# Concrete	$136.00		
Class C 2500# Concrete	$131.00		
Class D 2000# Concrete	$125.00		
Controllable Low Strength Material	$107.00		
(b) Partial Load Charge (if applicable)	$100.00		
(c) Unloading Charge past 30 minutes	$85.00		
(d) Cost of Adding Fiber to Concrete	$6.50		
Fuel Surcharge	$15.00		
Successful Bidder	✓		

c. Resolution No. 352-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase road salt from Cargill, Inc. to be used by the Public Works Department on an as needed basis for snow and ice removal in the amount of $71.71 per ton, as the result of a competitive bidding process with local vendor preference consideration.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase road salt from Cargill, Inc. to be used by the Public Works Department on an as needed basis for snow and ice removal in the amount of $71.71 per ton, as the result of a competitive bidding process with local vendor preference consideration.

Storage added that the City Manager's Office opened bids for road salt on an as needed based to be used by the City's Street Department, and the City tried to keep about 7,000 tons of road salt on hand. Two vendors submitted a bid: Cargill, Inc. of North Olmstead, Ohio, and Morton Salt, Inc. of Chicago, Illinois. Cargill submitted the lowest bid meeting specifications at $71.71 per ton.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the Resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution No. 352-20 approved.

Purchase of Road Salt for the Street Department		
Project No. 2020-013		
Bid Opening: June 24, 2020 @ 11:00am		
	Cargill, Inc.	Morton Salt, Inc.
	24950 Country Club Blvd., Suite 450	444 West Lake Street, Suite 3000
	North Olmsted, OH 44070	Chicago, IL 60606
	P: (800) 600-7258	P: (855)665-4540
	Salt_CusomerCareRoadSafety@Cargill.com	buyroadsalt@mortonsalt.com
Price Per Ton	$71.71	74.58
Successful Bidder	✓	

d. Resolution No. 353-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase various classes and sizes of aggregate from Shamblin Stone, Inc. at the prices listed on the attached tabulation sheet, as the result of a competitive bidding process. The aggregate will be used by the Public Works Department on projects undertaken throughout Fiscal Year 2020-2021.

   Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

   The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase various classes and sizes of aggregate from Shamblin Stone, Inc. at the prices listed on the attached tabulation sheet, as the result of a competitive bidding process. The aggregate will be used by the Public Works Department on projects undertaken throughout Fiscal Year 2020-2021.

Storage added that the City Manager's Office opened bids for various types of aggregate stone an as needed based to be used by the City's Street Department. One vendor submitted a bid: Shamblin Stone of Dunbar, West Virginia.

Councilmember Jenkins asked if glassed crushed into aggregate allowed under DOH rules and standards. Storage answered that he did not know, but that they typically do not use recycled goods, except for the use of recycled asphalt in certain construction projects.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution No. 353-20 approved.

Aggregate for Public Works			
Project No. 2020-015			
Bid Opening: June 24, 2020 @ 11:00am			
	Shamblin Stone, Inc.		
	70 Dunbar Avenue		
	Dunbar, WV 25064		
	P: (304) 766-7318		
	tmattox@wvpaving.com		
River Gravel:			
River Gravel #57	$28.20		
Masonry Sand	$25.65		
Dry Bed	$22.45		
Limestone:			
#2	No Bid		
#3	$26.05		
#57	$26.05		
#67	$26.75		
1 1/2" Crusher Run	$25.55		
#467	$26.05		
Plant Location Address:	70 Dunbar Avenue, Dunbar, WV		
Successful Bidder	✓		

e. Resolution No. 354-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to enter into an agreement with MSW Consultants in the amount of $35,300.00, for a feasibility study for the Recycling Program, as the result of a competitive bidding process.

   Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

   The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to enter into an agreement with MSW Consultants in the amount of $35,300.00 for a feasibility study for the Recycling Program, as the result of a competitive bidding process.

Storage added that the City Manager's Office opened bids for a consultant service to perform a feasibility study of the City's Recycling Program. The feasibility is a component part of a grant the City received from the West Virginia Department of Environmental Protection. Grant funds will be used to cover the costs of the study. 4 Companies submitted bids. Downstream Strategies was deemed disqualified because it failed to submit necessary paperwork with its bid. Based on scoring criterial applied by a scoring committee, MSW Consultants has been recommended as the successful vendor.

Councilmember Hoover asked what the main goal of the study was. Jane Bostic replied that the intent of the study is to take into consideration budget, current process, resources, education outreach, etc. The goal is to have better streamlined practices and better outreach in a holistic approach.

Councilmember Adams confirmed that the study should be finished by the end of October 2020, after which recommends will be made to the Mayor and Council.

Councilmember Jenkins confirmed that should be an opportunity for public input, but no specific meetings are planned yet. Mayor Goodwin added that the last study was done in 2015.

Councilmember Hoover asked how the Kanawha County Solid Waste Authority will fit into this. Bostic replied that the study will also show how the City can work better with the resources available.

Councilmember Jenkins asked if the study was to develop ideas with further studies possibly needed in the future. Mayor Goodwin said the City would need more people to recycle through education and other means to justify having a sustainable recycling program in the City.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution No. 354-20 approved.

Feasibility Study for the Recycling Program				
Project No. 2020-011				
Bid Opening: June 15, 2020 @ 11:00am				
		New/Gen Strategie and Solutions, LLC	**MSW Consultants**	**GT Environmental, Inc**
		8140 N Mopac Expy, Bldg 1, Ste 240	11875 High Tech Ave, Ste 150	2400 Corporate Exchange Dr. Ste 150
		Austin, TX 78759	Orlando, FL 32817	Columbus, OH 43231
		P: (512) 649-1254	p: (407) 380-8951	P: (614) 794-3570
		dyanke@newgenstrategies.net	jculbertson@mswconsultants.com	Rhansen@gtenvironmental.com
CRITERIA	Points Possible			
Cost Estimate	0-20	20	18	10
Proven ability to successfully meet all project milestones and complete project by contract deadline.	0-40	40	35	40
Experience in conducting Feasibility Studies.	0-20	12	19	15
Experience with Waste Management and Recycling Projects.	0-10	6	10	9
References from projects completed in the last five years.	0-10	10	10	10
Total Points	**100**	**88**	**92**	**84**
Project Total		$34,840.00	$35,300.00	$49,900.00
Project Completion		75	90	90
Successful Bidder			✓	

f. Resolution No. 355-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase various classes and sizes of aggregate from Shamblin Stone, Inc. at the prices listed on the attached tabulation sheet, as the result of a competitive bidding process. The aggregate will be used by the Public Works Department on projects undertaken throughout Fiscal Year 2020-2021.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase various classes and sizes of aggregate from Shamblin Stone, Inc. at the prices listed on the attached tabulation sheet, as the result of a competitive bidding process. The aggregate will be used by the Public Works Department on projects undertaken throughout Fiscal Year 2020-2021.

Storage added that the City Manager's Office opened bids for the City's annual road paving work. Three vendors submitted bids: Bear Contracting (Bridgeport, WV), WV Paving (Dunbar, WV), and MR Asphalt (Charleston, WV). Bear Contracting submitted the winning bid, and the Administration recommends approval of the purchase.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution No. 355-20 approved.

Road Paving June 2020
Project No. 2020-017
Bid Opening: June 29, 2020 @ 11:00am

	Bear Contracting LLC	**WV Paving**	**MR Asphalt, Inc.**
	PO Box 1196	2950 Charles Avenue	148 Hunters Cove
	Bridgeport, WV 26330	Dunbar, WV 25064	Charleston, WV 25320
	P: (304) 326-0160	P: (304) 768-9733	P: (304) 988-3789
	murso@bear-contracting.com	ben.bragg@wvpaving.com	mrasphaltboggess@aol.com
Project Total	$1,471,800.00	$1,518,160.00	$1,593,900.00
Local Vendor Preference (4%)	(5,000.00) $1,466,800.00	(5,000.00) $1,513,160.00	(5,000.00) $1,588,900.00
Successful Bidder with Local Preference Consideration	✓		

g. Resolution No. 356-20 - Authorizing settlement of pending disputed claims against the City in the matter known as Freda Gilmore v. City of Charleston, et al., Civil Action No. 2:20-cv-00022 in the United States District Court for the Southern District of West Virginia, as recommended by the City Solicitor.

Now, therefore, be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

That the City Council hereby authorizes and approves the settlement of pending disputed claims against the City by Freda Gilmore, as contained in Civil Action No. 2:20-cv-00022 in the United States District Court for the Southern District of West Virginia, in the amount of $80,000, as recommended by the City Solicitor. The City Council acknowledges that the settlement funds for Ms. Gilmore will be placed in trust for her benefit. The City Council authorizes the City Solicitor and City Manager to take all necessary steps to finalize resolution of the claims.

City Attorney, Kevin Baker, added that a settlement has been reached after a thorough and lengthy mediation. He believes it is in the best interest of all parties.

Councilmember Adams confirmed that Ms. Gilmore was represented by Counsel and a family member, and that it was a mutually aggregable resolution.

Councilmember Jenkins confirmed that the settlement resolves the matter for all defendants.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution No. 356-20 approved.

h. Resolution No. 357-20 - Authorizing the Mayor and City Manager to take all necessary steps to loan or donate the Kanawha Riflemen Memorial monument to the Craik-Patton House museum, the West Virginia State Museum, or another West Virginia history museum where it can be preserved and presented in historical context and requesting the Charleston Historic Landmarks Commission to prepare a proposal to the City regarding a new monument and other historical markers necessary to present the history of Ruffner Park in a historically accurate manner.

   Now, therefore, be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

   That the Mayor and City Manager are authorized to take all necessary steps to loan or donate the Kanawha Riflemen Memorial monument to the Craik-Patton House museum, the West Virginia State Museum, or another West Virginia history museum where it can be preserved and presented in historical context.

   And that the Charleston Historic Landmarks Commission is requested to prepare a proposal to the City regarding a new monument and other historical markers necessary to present the history of Ruffner Park in a historically accurate manner.

Baker added that that the monument would be loaned or donated to a museum; the Craik-Patton House are considering taking the monument. Other options include the State museum, or the museum located at Marshall University. He said the history of the land is a fascinating story that deserves be told. He added that no person listed on the plaque is buried in the former cemetery.

Councilmember Ceperley confirmed that the current plan is to remove the plaque and keep the stone monument where it is. Also, it is unlikely that anyone still buried on the property was a Confederate soldier.

Councilmember Jenkins confirmed that the Charleston Historic Landmarks Commission will discuss a full plan for the new version of the monument.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution No. 357-20 approved.

Councilmember Reishman motioned to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting adjourned.