JOURNAL of the PROCEEDINGS
of the
CITY COUNCIL

CITY OF CHARLESTON, WEST VIRGINIA

Regular Meeting – Monday, March 2, 2020

at 7:00 P.M.

Council Chamber – City Hall – Charleston, West Virginia

OFFICIAL RECORD

Amy Shuler Goodwin
Mayor

Miles C. Cary II
City Clerk

CALL TO ORDER

The Council met in the Chambers of the City Building at 7:00 P.M., for the first meeting in the month of March on the 2nd day, in the year 2020, and was called to order by the Honorable Mayor, Amy Shuler Goodwin. The invocation was delivered by Councilmember Knauff and the Pledge of Allegiance was led Councilmember Jones. The Honorable Clerk, Miles C. Cary II, called the roll of members and it was found that there were present at the time:

ADAMS	**BAILEY**	**BAYS**
BURTON	**CAMPBELL**	**CEPERLEY**
COOK	**FAEGRE**	**HAAS**
HOOVER	**JENKINS**	**JONES**
KING	**KNAUFF**	**LAIRD**
MCKINNEY	**MINARDI**	**OVERSTREET**
PERSINGER	**PHARR**	**REISHMAN**
ROBINSON*	**SHEETS**	**SNODGRASS**
STEELE	**WESLEY-PLEAR**	**MAYOR GOODWIN**

With twenty-seven members being present, the Mayor declared a quorum present.
*Councilmember Robinson left the floor at approximately 8:00 p.m., and participated in all votes.

Pending the reading of the Journal of the previous meeting, the reading thereof was dispensed with and the same duly approved.

PUBLIC SPEAKERS

1. Kevin Madison – Announced the creation of the Downtown Charleston Association.

CLAIMS

NONE.

COMMUNICATIONS

NONE

PROCLAMATIONS

1.

EXECUTIVE DEPARTMENT
CITY OF CHARLESTON
PROCLAMATION

WHEREAS: West Virginia women have made historic contributions to the growth and strength of our Capital City and our State; and

WHEREAS: Women served as early leaders in the forefront of many progressive social change movements—including the civil rights movement, the industrial labor movement and securing their right to vote; and

WHEREAS: In February 1920, the West Virginia Legislature met in special session and were lobbied heavily by the state's suffragists, led by Lenna Lowe Yost; and

WHEREAS: In a fifteen to fourteen vote on March 10, the state Senate made West Virginia the thirty-fourth of the thirty-six states needed to ratify the 19th amendment; and

WHEREAS: This year marks the 100th anniversary of the passage of the 19th Amendment, guaranteeing and protecting women's constitutional right to vote; and

WHEREAS: We recognize the courageous women leaders who lobbied, marched, picketed and protested—who never gave up the fight for equality—and those who remain active in the pursuit of equal rights for all.

NOW THEREFORE, I, Amy Shuler Goodwin, Mayor of the City of Charleston, do hereby proclaim March 2020, as

WOMEN'S HISTORY MONTH

in celebration of the 100th anniversary of women's right to vote and to commemorate the economic, cultural and social contributions of women throughout our City and State.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have set my hand and caused the Seal of the Executive Department to be affixed this 2nd day of March 2020.

Amy Shuler Goodwin, Mayor

The Proclamation was presented to Julie Palas (Women's Commission), Rita Ray (NOW), Deb Weinstein and Deedra Keys Switzer (YWCA).

2.

EXECUTIVE DEPARTMENT
CITY OF CHARLESTON
PROCLAMATION

WHEREAS: Youth sports are a good way to increase physical activity, develop lifelong habits for good health and encourage confidence; and

WHEREAS: Teamwork and leadership skills developed while playing sports help our youth communicate and problem solve in school and later in their lives in the workforce; and

WHEREAS: Coaches do more than teach a sport. They are often mentors, a listening ear and the inspiration that guides and shapes the lives of our young athletes; and

WHEREAS: The City of Charleston is home to many sports teams in our local schools and communities –including several state championship teams; and

WHEREAS: On February 27, 2020 the Stonewall Jackson Generals defeated the South Charleston Cubs in a hard-fought win to secure the Kanawha County Middle School Boys Championship at West Virginia State University.

NOW THEREFORE, I, Amy Shuler Goodwin, Mayor of the City of Charleston, do hereby recognize the players and coaches of the

2020 Stonewall Jackson Generals Boys Basketball

for their outstanding achievements–finishing the regular season 16 and 1 and ending the year as the Kanawha County Middle School Champs.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have set my hand and caused the Seal of the Executive Department to be affixed this 2nd day of March 2020.

THE CITY OF CHARLESTON WEST VIRGINIA

Amy Shuler Goodwin, Mayor

The Proclamation was presented to members of the team.

PUBLIC HEARING

1. After duly being published as required, the Mayor declared the floor open for a Public Hearing on Bill No. 7868 - Authorizing the design, acquisition and construction of certain extensions, additions, betterments and improvements to the existing sewerage system of The City of Charleston; authorizing the issuance of not more than $16,000,000 in aggregate principal amount of Sewerage System Revenue Bonds. No person from the public came to speak in reference to the Public Hearing. The Mayor declared the Public Hearing CLOSED.

REPORTS OF COMMITTEES

COMMITTEE ON PARKING FACILITIES

Councilmember Jenkins, Chair of the Council Committee on Parking Facilities, submitted the following reports:

1. Your committee on Parking Facilities has had under consideration the following bill, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Bill No. 7868 do pass.

Bill No. 7868 - A BILL to amend and reenact Chapter 114, Article VII, Section 114-602 of the Code of the City of Charleston, as amended, relating to authorizing the Charleston Coliseum & Convention Center / Municipal Auditorium Board to set parking garage rates; and requiring that a percentage of the parking revenue be placed in a special revenue account for capital improvements for parking facilities.

Now, therefore, be it ordained by the Council of the City of Charleston:

That Chapter 114, Article VII, Section 114-602 of the Code of the City of Charleston, as amended, is hereby amended and reenacted to read as follows:

Chapter 114 – Traffic Ordinance
Article VII. STOPPING, STANDING AND PARKING

Sec. 114-602. - Management of and regulations governing city-owned lots and buildings.

(a) Unless otherwise provided herein, all parking lots and parking buildings owned or operated by the city shall be operated under the control and management of the parking facilities committee, who are hereby authorized to promulgate rules and regulations governing such usage not inconsistent herewith. There shall be a Director of Parking, who shall carry out the efficient administration of the provisions of this section and any associated rules and regulations, promulgated by the parking facilities committee, including but not limited to the authority and discretion to enter into and suspend agreements to lease parking spaces on a month to month basis, set days and hours of operation, collect and adjust parking fees and fines, and to make provisions for special events or open rent-free parking when deemed in the best interest of the city.

(b) Motor vehicles shall be parked, placed, handled and driven into, from, in and on such parking lots and such parking buildings in accordance with the applicable laws and ordinances of the city relative to traffic upon the streets in the city, and in accordance with any rules and regulations respecting usage of such parking lots and parking buildings which are adopted and

promulgated by the parking facilities committee and the directions, instructions and order of the Director of Parking or official city attendants at any such lot or building.

(c) It shall be unlawful for any person or vehicle to block any driveway or passageway in or upon such parking lots or parking buildings, or for persons to leave or park cars therein contrary to the applicable ordinances, rules and regulations and instructions of attendants, as aforesaid, or without paying the required rental fees.

(d) No fees or charges shall be required for metered or unmetered spaces in such lots or buildings at times other than those expressly posted at the site, or when provisions have been made for event parking, or as expressly provided herein.

(1) Specific unmetered spaces may be reserved from 7:00 a.m. through 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday, by paid-up lease on a month to month basis according to the rates identified in this section; provided, nothing herein shall preclude the Director for good cause from designating spaces as assigned or reserved at other times.

(2) All fees for monthly rentals shall be paid in advance prior to the first day of the month; provided, the rental fee for the initial month of any newly activated account may be prorated based upon the date of activation.

(3) An administration fee of $15.00 per space shall be charged to any account that is delinquent past the tenth day of the month. The director of parking shall provide notice of the assessment of the administrative fee with the further statement that if the account is delinquent past the twentieth day of the month, then the account will be considered closed and the vehicle associated with the account will be treated as a typical vehicle without a monthly account.

(4) An administration fee of $10.00 per space shall apply for the activation of any monthly rental agreement, or the replacement of an electronic entry key or any placard or decal provided to identify license or assignment of a reserved space.

(5) Nothing herein shall preclude the immediate revocation and/or reassignment of parking privileges in the event of nonpayment or a violation of the rules.

(6) Unless otherwise provided herein, Event Parking at any city-operated lot or building shall be at the minimum rate of $3.00 per vehicle.

(e) City Off-Street Lots. The daily rental fee for each separate usage of any single parking space on any city owned or operated parking lot not specifically set forth below shall be at the rate of $3.00 per day. The monthly rental fee for reserved usage of any unmetered space in a city owned or operated lot not otherwise expressly set forth below shall be $50.00 per month. The rental fee for each separate usage of a single metered parking space in a city owned or operated off-street parking lot, not otherwise expressly set forth below, shall be at the rate of $0.25 per hour.

(1) Municipal Auditorium. The rental fee for each separate usage of any single metered parking space in the city-owned lot behind the municipal auditorium shall be $0.50 per hour and the rental fee for the reserved usage of any unmetered space shall be $40.00 per month.

(2) Summers Street Alley. The rental fee for the reserved usage of any unmetered space in the Summers Street alley shall be $80.00 per month.

(3) West Side Lots. The rental fee for each separate usage of any single metered parking space in city owned or operated lots on the West Side, Elk City district, shall be $0.25 per hour and the rental fee for the reserved usage of any unmetered space shall be $35.00 per month.

(4) Morris Street Lot. The rental for each separate usage of any space that is not otherwise made available for metered parking in the city-owned Morris Street lot shall be $40.00 per month; provided, any such rented space which is unoccupied at the commencement of an event parking period shall be available for event parking on a first come first served basis and subject to the event parking rate.

(5) Smith Street Lot. The rental for each separate usage of any space that is not otherwise made available for metered parking in the city-owned Smith Street lot shall be $30.00 per month; provided, any such rented space which is unoccupied at the commencement of an event parking period shall be available for event parking on a first come first served basis and subject to the event parking rate.

(6) Union Building Parking Lot. The monthly rental rate for each parking space at the city-owned Union Building Parking Lot located between Kanawha Boulevard and the Kanawha River just east of the Union Building shall be at a rate of $70.00 per month; provided, any such rented space which is unoccupied at the commencement of an event parking period shall be available for event parking on a first come first served basis and subject to the event parking rate.

(f) City Parking Buildings. Unless otherwise provided herein, the following provisions of this section shall apply to city-owned parking buildings.

(1) Parking Building No. 1—McFarland Street Garage. The rental fee for the reserved usage of any unmetered space on Floor 6 or above in Building No. 1 shall be $45.00 per month; on all other floors, the rental fee shall be $65.00 per month.

(2) Parking Building No. 2—Washington Street Garage. The rental fee for the reserved usage of any unmetered space in Parking Building No. 2 shall be $35.00 per month.

(3) Parking Building No. 3—Convention Center North/Greyhound Garage. Parking Building No. 3 shall be under the control and management of the Charleston Coliseum and Convention Center / Municipal Auditorium Board. Unless a The Charleston Coliseum and Convention Center Rate Ordinance provides for other or additional fees for parking in Building No. 3, event or daily parking shall be the rate of $3.00 per vehicle; monthly parking shall be at the rate of $25.00 per vehicle / Municipal Auditorium Board shall have discretion to set the parking rates in Parking Building No. 3. Twenty percent (20%) of all parking revenue collected from Parking Building No. 3 shall be deposited into a special revenue account designated solely to capital improvements for parking facilities under the control and management of the Board.

(4) Parking Building No. 4—Convention Center South/Quarrier Street Garage. Parking Building No. 4 shall be under the control and management of the Charleston Coliseum and Convention Center / Municipal Auditorium Board. Unless the The Charleston Coliseum and Convention Center Rate Ordinance provides for other or additional fees for parking in Building No. 4, event or daily parking shall be the rate of $3.00 per vehicle; monthly parking shall be at the rate of $25.00 per vehicle / Municipal Auditorium Board shall have discretion to set the

parking rates in Parking Building No. 4. Twenty percent (20%) of all parking revenue collected from Parking Building No. 4 shall be deposited into a special revenue account designated solely to capital improvements for parking facilities under the control and management of the Board.

(5) Parking Building No. 5—Shanklin/City Hall Garage. The rental fee for the reserved usage of any unmetered space on Floor 4 and above in Parking Building No. 5 shall be $45.00 per month; on all other floors, the rental fee shall be $65.00 per month.

(6) Parking Building No. 6—Summers Street Garage. The rental fee for the reserved usage of any unmetered space in Parking Building No. 6 shall be $80.00 per month.

(7) The Director shall designate no fewer than 20 spaces at the lowest or most convenient level practical within each city-owned parking building and equip the same with SMART meters for the use of daily or itinerate parkers, and shall designate as many spaces as practical on the unsheltered rooftop of each building and equip the same with mechanical meters for the use of daily or itinerate parkers; provided, this provision shall not apply to Buildings No. 3 or No. 4 which shall be controlled and operated by the Charleston Coliseum and Convention Center / Municipal Auditorium Board; provided further, that this provision shall not apply to Building No. 2, which shall be controlled and operated by the director of parking consistent with the provisions of subdivision (10) of this subsection.

(8) The rental fee for each separate usage of a SMART metered parking space in a city-owned parking building shall be $1.00 per hour between the hours of 7:00 a.m. and 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

(9) The rental fee for each separate usage of a single metered parking space on the rooftop of a city-owned parking building shall be at the rate of $0.25 per hour, from 7:00 a.m. through 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

(10) Parking Building No. 2 will continue to be operated with an electronic entry key and ticketed system at the direction of the director of parking. Parking in Parking Building No. 2 shall be free on Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays. The director of parking has the authority to set parking rates for the building and to set hours during which parking rates are charged and collected on Monday through Friday, excluding holidays, provided that the hours during which parking rates are charged shall begin no later than 9:00 a.m. and end no earlier than 5:00 p.m. The hours during which the parking booth may be attended and actively collecting parking fees may be set at the discretion of the director of parking. The discretion given to the director of parking in this subdivision is subject to active lease agreements maintained by the City with tenants of Parking Building No. 2.

Councilmember Jenkins added that the bill removes the set parking fee of $3.00 for the

Charleston Coliseum and Convention Center's two Parking Garages in the City Code. It then gives discretion to the Coliseum and Convention Center Board to vary what is charged for different events.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the bill. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. A roll call was taken:

YEAS: Adams, Bailey, Bays, Burton, Campbell, Ceperley, Cook, Faegre, Haas, Hoover, Jenkins, Jones, King, Knauff, Laird, McKinney, Minardi, Overstreet, Persinger, Pharr, Reishman, Robinson, Sheets, Snodgrass, Steele, Wesley-Plear, Mayor Goodwin
NAYS: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, the Mayor declared Bill No. 7868 passed.

COMMITTEE ON PLANNING, STREETS AND TRAFFIC

Councilmember Hoover, Chair of the Council Committee on Planning, Streets and Traffic, submitted the following reports:

1. Your committee on Planning, Streets and Traffic has had under consideration the following bill, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Bill No. 7862 do pass.

Bill No. 7862 - A Bill to repeal Ordinance No. 2997, passed by Council August 16, 1982, which created a 30 minute parking zone on the south side of Franklin Avenue from a point 32 feet west of the intersection of Franklin Avenue and Greenbrier Street to a point 69 Feet west of the intersection of Franklin Avenue and Greenbrier Street during the hours from 7:00 AM to 5:00 PM, Monday through Friday and amending the Traffic Control Map and Traffic Control File, established by the code of the City of Charleston, West Virginia, two thousand and three, as amended, Traffic Laws, Section 263, Division 2, Article 4, Chapter 114, to conform therewith.

Now, therefore, be it ordained by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:
Section 1. The 30 minute parking zone on the south side of Franklin Avenue from a point 32 feet west of the intersection of Franklin Avenue and Greenbrier Street to a point 69 Feet west of the intersection of Franklin Avenue and Greenbrier Street during the hours from 7:00 AM to 5:00 PM, Monday through Friday is hereby repealed
Section 2. The Traffic Control Map and Traffic Control File, established by the code of the City of Charleston, West Virginia, two thousand and three, as amended, Traffic Laws, Section 263, Division 2, Article 4, Chapter 114, shall be and
hereby are amended, to conform to this Ordinance.

Section 3. All prior Ordinances, inconsistent with this Ordinance are hereby repealed to the extent of said inconsistency.

Councilmember Hoover added that the associated signs went up in 1982, mostly likely for a

daycare that is no longer present. The repeal was a request from the neighborhood.

Councilmember Hoover moved to approve the bill. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. A roll call was taken:

YEAS: Adams, Bailey, Bays, Burton, Campbell, Ceperley, Cook, Faegre, Haas, Hoover, Jenkins, Jones, King, Knauff, Laird, McKinney, Minardi, Overstreet, Persinger, Pharr, Reishman, Robinson, Sheets, Snodgrass, Steele, Wesley-Plear, Mayor Goodwin
NAYS: NONE
ABSENT: NONE

With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, the Mayor declared Bill No. 7862 passed.

COMMITTEE ON FINANCE

Councilmember Jenkins, Chair of the Council Committee on Finance, submitted the following reports:

1. Your committee on Finance has had under consideration the following resolution, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Resolution No. 298-20 do pass.

Resolution No. 298-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to submit an application to the FEMA Assistance to Firefighter Grant Program in the amount of $114,004, that includes the required 10% match, and administer any funds awarded. The Charleston Fire Department will use these funds to purchase 60 sets of bunker gear.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to submit an application to the FEMA Assistance to Firefighter Grant Program in the amount of $114,004, that includes the required 10% match, and administer any funds awarded. The Charleston Fire Department will use these funds to purchase 60 sets of bunker gear.

Councilmember Jenkins added that the resolution will authorize the Fire Department to get equipment that they need to keep the population safe.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the Resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, the Mayor declared Resolution No. 298-20 adopted.

2. Your committee on Finance has had under consideration the following resolution, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Resolution No. 299-20 do pass.

Resolution No. 299-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager, subject to final review by the City Attorney, to enter into contracts through Assured Partners of WV and Arthur J. Gallagher Risk Management Services, Inc., at a price of $1,364,363.09, for the City's Risk Management and Property and Casualty Insurance coverage for the period March 31, 2020 through March 31, 2021, in accordance with the costs attached, and specifically by rejecting all underinsured motorists coverage and accepting uninsured motorists coverage with statutory minimum limits of $25,000/$50,000/$25,000 only; and Risk Management Services Co. (RMSC) for Third Party Administration of Workers Compensation and Property/Casualty Claims in accordance with the costs attached and a fee advance of $103,720.00; and further authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to sign the appropriate forms rejecting the underinsured motorists coverage and accepting the uninsured motorists coverage.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

That the Mayor or City Manager is hereby authorized and directed, subject to final review by the City Attorney, to enter into contracts through Assured Partners of WV and Arthur J. Gallagher Risk Management Services, Inc., at a price of $1,364,363.09, for the City's Risk Management and Property and Casualty Insurance coverage for the period March 31, 2020 through March 31, 2021, in accordance with the costs attached, and specifically by rejecting all underinsured motorists coverage and accepting uninsured motorists coverage with statutory minimum limits of $25,000/$50,000/$25,000 only; and Risk Management Services Co. (RMSC) for Third Party Administration of Workers Compensation and Property/Casualty Claims in accordance with the costs attached and a fee advance of $103,720.00; and further authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to sign the appropriate forms rejecting the underinsured motorists coverage and accepting the uninsured motorists coverage.

Councilmember Jenkins added that the Committee met on February 24, 2020 to discuss and view the presentation from the City's long-time broker, Frank Baer from AssuredPartners. The City of Charleston has a unique liability and risk insurance, covering workers comp, cyber liability, property damage etc. It's been a program that is believed to have worked over the years in that it saves the City a substantial amount in premium fees, partly because the City is self-insured up to a certain amount (typically about $300,000 with the layers of insurance added on top). He acknowledged there had been an issue with regards to the use of the same broker over such a long period of time. However, he believed that, in terms of this policy, the City had been getting good consulting work from AssuredPartners. They had checked about forty (40) different insurers to see if they would be interested in this coverage, with one even visiting the City to evaluate the properties (they declined coverage because the City has over 400 million is covered property). In addition, when compared to what other cities pay (and the proposal from BRIM for 8 million), the City is getting a good deal. He noted that Huntington is paying around 4 million. Councilmember Jenkins added that they will most likely take steps to look into possible alternatives for the future. The premium is about $230,000 more for the renewal, but it is believed to be more a reflection of the market (with regard to property casualty) than anything the City has done. In fact, the City has had very good risk and claims management for the past several years, to where the out-of-pocket expenses have decreased drastically in the past five years.

Councilmember Snodgrass added that she was now going to repeat what she had previously stated during the Finance meeting. With lots of changes across the board with the upcoming budget, she found it almost lacking that it is one of the top ticket items of 1.36 million and the same broker had been used for over thirty-eight (38) years. In the face of transparency, it was egregious that there weren't Request for Proposals at least to look at it. Councilmember Snodgrass added that she voted no during Finance over a few points, one of which was that the City didn't get RFPs but will do so over much smaller amounts. Secondly, it takes some time (3 months or so) to get those kinds of numbers back, and the Committee did not get a lot of time (it was presented to Finance in February) to engage in a conversation about this resolution. The broker's fee is 10-15%. The same broker owns the AP Risk Management portion ($35,000) which is a separate line item on top of the broker fee. The City also pays for the Gallagher broker, which she felt should have been paid by the broker for which the City is already paying. Lastly, the TPA that the City uses to service its claims is also owned by the same company. Councilmember Snodgrass added that during the Finance meeting, she recommended that the resolution be amended to remove certain items but was out voted. She hopes that a Committee will be formed in the next few months to examine the entire scope of the insurance coverage. She has volunteered for this Committee.

Councilmember King recalled that during last year's renewal during Council, he had asked if alternate quotes were obtained and was told that would happen for this current year. Councilmember King stated he found it hard to believe another package from someone else

couldn't be found. Additionally, the fact that one of the providers and the additional broker is also owned by the broker's company, who is taking a commission from that, appears to be a conflict.

City Manager, Jonathan Storage, noted that as it relates to the property and casualty insurance, the City has hired a broker, Commercial Insurance now doing business as AssuredPartners, for some thirty (30) years. Some people had raised questions about why the City would have a long-standing professional relationship with the same entity for so long. He stated that he did not necessarily disagree, and that it needs to be reviewed to see whether or not the City is getting the best relationship just like anything else that is procured that requires a professional service. Low cost for a professional service is not what is always wanted. Going to a low cost lawyer, doctor, etc. is not always the best service, but he takes it as granted that this is something that needs to be periodically reviewed. Storage did not know AssuredPartners and Frank Baer until he took the position of City Manager. Since they had to review the policy in March of 2019 when the Administration was new with little time to review it, he gave Baer a very detailed and specific directive to justify, define and go see what the best options for the City were. Baer has done that to his satisfaction as he has sought quotes from at least forty (40) different insurance carriers, many of whom declined. Storage added that when dealing with these types of environments and how long it takes to procure these quotes, an RFP for all insurance for the City of Charleston with the Administration trying to cobble that together to get the best arrangement would be unmanagable. The City has to rely on professionals to give it guidance and the best advice based on their search in the marketplace. The relationship with AssuredPartners can be reviewed; Storage recommended an RFP for the brokerage and not all insurance. He added that Baer spent months searching this out and provided a presentation to the Finance Committee on February 24, 2020. It took a lot of wrangling with the insurance providers to get true numbers in advance of the renewal which is taking place on March 31, 2020. The Administration had been in communication with the Finance Chair for a long time, talking about what the numbers would most likely be despite the fact that they didn't receive final numbers until recently. Storage added that he understands there is a concern about the Third Party Administrator, and that will be reviewed. In fact, this is the last year for the contract with the current TPA. As it relates to the brokerage fee, AssuredPartners did not have to itemize the separate fees, which they did for transparency and in the same format and way as every past year. He noted that if the City does seek an RFP in the coming years, they might not want to do business with the City anymore considering the City would essentially be pulling the rug out from under a consultant who would be expecting those fees. He added that he is happy to work with any member of Council to review the arrangement.

Councilmember King added that he understood that it is a long, difficult process to put together a package for a large municipality, but there are probably hundreds of insurance brokers that could be asked to provide a quote, which would have been the right thing to do. Additionally, he felt that if the broker is an owner of one of the insurance companies, they shouldn't receive

that commission.

Councilmember Jenkins added that the packet included the insurers that were contacted by AssuredPartners and their reasons for declining. In terms of the excess property, the issue is the City is looking to insure 400 million of property; most insurance companies do not want to get into that high of a level. There is also a quote from BRIM (many local governments in West Virginia use them) for 12 million. He added that one competitor, Safety National Liability did come close to beating the BRIT package that the City has traditionally used. CHUB was close, but declined once they inspected. Councilmember Jenkins further explained that if the City had a multi-line of insurance incident, the City would have been out of pocket for each one (workers comp, property, liability etc.). In the current program, the out of pocket is an aggregate for all of those lines of insurance. It becomes more expensive if we pay out of pocket up to $300,000 for each of those lines (workers comp, property, liability etc.). A Select Committee will be established to look into whether an RFP is feasible in this type of situation. He added that he believes that since this is a professional service, an RFP might not be the best for something this complicated.

Councilmember King stated that he appreciated Councilmember Jenkins comments. He didn't think that the City should say that it shouldn't request proposals for something like this because the broker the City had been using for thirty-eight years might be offended. If the City doesn't want to do that, or if they aren't interested, the City will find somebody else with which to do business.

Councilmember Faegre added that while she doesn't know a lot about insurance, she does know about fees from working in a law firm. Attorney's charge a percentage of what they do for their clients. She advised caution against stepping on "other people's toes" when the City has a loyal carrier/broker.

Councilmember Burton abstained from voting.

Councilmember Campbell abstained from voting out of an overabundance of caution as he formally worked for AssuredPartners and is under at least one contractual obligation to the company.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. A roll call was taken:

YEAS: Adams, Bailey, Bays, Ceperley, Cook, Faegre, Haas, Hoover, Jenkins, Jones, Knauff, Laird, McKinney, Minardi, Overstreet, Persinger, Pharr, Reishman, Robinson, Sheets, Steele, Wesley-Plear, Mayor Goodwin
NAYS: King, Snodgrass
ABSTAIN: Burton, Campbell
ABSENT: NONE

With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, with two abstentions and two Nays, the Mayor declared Resolution No. 299-20 adopted.

3. Your committee on Finance has had under consideration the following resolution, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Resolution No. 300-20 do pass.

Resolution No. 300-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to take all necessary steps to exercise the optional redemption of the Charleston Building Commission (West Virginia) Public Safety Center Lease-Revenue Refunding Bonds, Series 2009A and the Charleston Building Commission (West Virginia) Lease-Revenue Refunding Bonds (Center for Arts and Sciences of West Virginia Project), Series 2010.

Now, therefore, be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

That the Mayor and City Manager are authorized to take all necessary steps to exercise the optional redemption of the Charleston Building Commission (West Virginia) Public Safety Center Lease-Revenue Refunding Bonds, Series 2009A and the Charleston Building Commission (West Virginia) Lease-Revenue Refunding Bonds (Center for Arts and Sciences of West Virginia Project), Series 2010. Specifically, the Mayor and City Manager are authorized to direct the Charleston Building Commission to exercise the optional redemption, provide the required certificate to the Bond Trustee on behalf of the Charleston Building Commission, and make any payments necessary to redeem the bonds and pay any reasonable costs, fees, and expenses of the Bond Trustee and the Charleston Building Commission in connection with the redemption.

Councilmember Jenkins added that the resolution is with respect to two bonds on the principal amount ($1.1 million and approximately 1.2 million). Being that the maturity date is in 2024, the City will save approximately $314,000 per year by paying these off early.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the Resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, the Mayor declared Resolution No. 300-20 adopted.

4. Your committee on Finance has had under consideration the following resolution, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Resolution No. 301-20 do pass.

Resolution No. 301-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase a Class 7 Grand Cherokee WKJH74 utility vehicle from Stephens Auto Center for $26,059 pursuant to a competitively-sourced state-wide contract with the West Virginia Purchasing Division. The vehicle will replace a fleet vehicle (Unit 508) within the City Engineering Department pursuant to the City's vehicle life-cycle replacement schedule.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase a Class 7 Grand Cherokee WKJH74 utility vehicle from Stephens Auto Center for $26,059 pursuant to a competitively-sourced state-wide contract with the West Virginia Purchasing Division. The vehicle will replace a fleet vehicle (Unit 508) within the City Engineering Department pursuant to the City's vehicle life-cycle replacement schedule.

Councilmember Jenkins added that this is a normal replacement of Unit 508 with a competitively-sourced state-wide contract with the West Virginia Purchasing Division.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the Resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, the Mayor declared Resolution 301-20 adopted.

Class 7 - Automobile
Mid Size Utility

Vendor Name:	**Stephens Auto Center**	**Vendor Contact:**	**Mike Ballard**
Manufacturer/Brand:	FCA Jeep	**Phone No.:**	304-369-2411
Model Name & Number:	Grand Cherokee WKJH74	**Email:**	mballard@stephensauto.com

Vehicle Requirements:

Classification:	Mid Size Utility
Drive:	4 Wheel/All Wheel
Passenger seating:	5 minimum (including driver)
Doors:	4, minimum
Wheelbase:	109 in., minimum
GVWR:	6100 lbs. min, 7300 lbs. max.
Engine:	6 cylinder minimum
Additional Requirements:	
The vehicle bid shall include the standard equipment requirements as required in section 3.1.1.1 of the specification.	

Manufacturer's Standard Available Colors	
Standard Color Code	**Color Description**
PSC	Billet Silver
PW7	Bright White
PXJ	Diamond Black
PAU	Granite Crystal
PDN	Sting Gray
PRV	Velvet Red
PUW	Walnut Brown

Vendor Bid Response:

Vehicle fuel type	EPA HIGHWAY MPG Rating	EPA CITY MPG Rating	Unit Price	Total Life Cycle Cost
Gasoline	25	18	$26,059.00	$38,128.44
Flex-fuel				
Diesel				
CNG/Bifuel				
Hybrid				

***Options:**

FOB Dealership: (Deduct)	N/A
FOB Other than Metro Charleston - Per Mile	$ 2.00

*Note - The above delivery "options" above are not evaluated as part of the award.

5. Your committee on Finance has had under consideration the following resolution, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Resolution No. 302-20 do pass.

Resolution No. 302-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase a Class 8 Grand Cherokee WKJH74 utility vehicle from Stephens Auto Center for $28,924 pursuant to a competitively-sourced state-wide contract with the West Virginia Purchasing Division. The vehicle will replace a fleet vehicle (Unit 1101) within the Department of Homeland Security and Emergency Management pursuant to the City's vehicle life-cycle replacement schedule.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase a Class 8 Grand Cherokee WKJH74 utility vehicle from Stephens Auto Center for $28,924 pursuant to a competitively-sourced state-wide contract with the West Virginia Purchasing Division. The vehicle will replace a fleet vehicle (Unit 1101) within the Department of Homeland Security and Emergency Management pursuant to the City's vehicle life-cycle replacement schedule.

Councilmember Jenkins Councilmember Jenkins added that this is a normal replacement of Unit 1101 with a competitively-sourced state-wide contract with the West Virginia Purchasing Division.

Councilmember Campbell asked the difference between a Class 7 and 8 Grand Cherokee. Storage added that it has to do with the off-road packaging. The Emergency Manager has more off-road needs.

Councilmember Jones asked why an off-road vehicle would be needed for work inside the City. Mayor Goodwin answered because they might have to go out in the middle of the night despite any hazardous conditions.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the Resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, the Mayor declared Resolution No. 302-20 adopted.

Class 8 - Automobile
Mid Size Utility

Vendor Name:	Stephens Auto Center	**Vendor Contact:**	Mike Ballard
Manufacturer/Brand:	FCA Jeep	**Phone No.:**	304-369-2411
Model Name & Number:	Grand Cherokee WKJH74	**Email:**	mballard@stephensauto.com

Vehicle Requirements:

Classification:	Mid Size Utility
Drive:	4 Wheel/All Wheel with High and Low Range
Passenger seating:	5 minimum (including driver)
Doors:	4, minimum
Wheelbase:	109 in., minimum
GVWR:	6100 lbs. min, 7300 lbs. max.
Engine:	6 cylinder, Minimum
Off Road Package:	Includes but not limited to: Limited Slip rear, axle traction lock differential, heavy duty engine cooling, skid plates, gas shocks, tow hooks and all terrain tires.
Tow Package:	Installed Hitch & Wiring
Slush/All-Weather Mats:	Installed: Driver, Passenger, Cargo Areas

Additional Requirements:

The vehicle bid shall include the standard equipment requirements as required in section 3.1.1.1 of the specification.

Manufacturer's Standard Available Colors	
Standard Color Code	**Color Description**
PSC	Billet Silver
PW7	Bright White
PXJ	Diamond Black
PAU	Granite Crystal
PDN	Sting Gray
PRV	Velvet Red
PUW	Walnut Brown

Vendor Bid Response:

Vehicle fuel type	EPA HIGHWAY MPG Rating	EPA CITY MPG Rating	Unit Price	Total Life Cycle Cost
Gasoline	25	18	$28,924.00	$40,993.44
Flex-fuel				
Diesel				
CNG/Bifuel				
Hybrid				

*Options:

FOB Dealership: (Deduct)	N/A
FOB Other than Metro Charleston - Per Mile	$ 2.00

*Note - The above delivery "options" above are not evaluated as part of the award.

6. Your committee on Finance has had under consideration the following resolution, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Resolution No. 303-20 do pass.

Resolution No. 303-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase a Class 31 Ram 3500 D28L92 truck from Stephens Auto Center for $34,365 pursuant to a competitively-sourced state-wide contract with the West Virginia Purchasing Division. The vehicle will replace a fleet vehicle (Unit 18) within the Street Department pursuant to the City's vehicle life-cycle replacement schedule.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase a Class 31 Ram 3500 D28L92 truck from Stephens Auto Center for $34,365 pursuant to a competitively-sourced state-wide contract with the West Virginia Purchasing Division. The vehicle will replace a fleet vehicle (Unit 18) within the Street Department pursuant to the City's vehicle life-cycle replacement schedule.

Councilmember Jenkins added that this is also a vehicle being replaced under the City's vehicle life-cycle replacement schedule so that vehicles are kept fairly new and road ready.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the Resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, the Mayor declared Resolution No. 303-20 adopted.

Class 31 - Automobile
1 Ton, Dual Rear Wheel, Crew Cab

Vendor Name:	Stephens Auto Center	**Vendor Contact:**	Mike Ballard
Manufacturer/Brand:	FCA	**Phone No.:**	304-369-2411
Model Name & Number:	Ram 3500 D28L92	**Email:**	mballard@stephensauto.com

Vehicle Requirements:

Classification:	1 Ton Dual Rear wheel Crew Cab
Drive:	4 Wheel Drive
Passenger seating:	Minimum of 5(including driver)
Doors:	4, minimum
Wheelbase:	158" – 170"
GVWR:	13,000 minimum
Engine:	Minimum 6.6 Liter Turbo Diesel with Engine Block Heater; 8 cylinder Gasoline
Torque:	Minimum of 765 lb. ft.
Rear Axle:	Minimum 3.73 Ratio (gas), Minimum 3.42 (diesel). Must include Limited Slip/Traction Lock with Dual Rear Wheels
Tow Capacity:	19,000 lbs. minimum
Tow Package:	Installed Receiver Hitch & 7-pin Wiring, Trailer Tow Side Electric Mirrors, Factory Installed Electric Trailer Brake Controller
Slush/All weather Mats	Installed on driver and passenger front and second row, except where vinyl floor covering is present.
Bed:	Spray-in bed liner only
Additional Requirements:	Installed Side Step Bars, All-Season Tires, Full size spare, frame mounted with jack

Manufacturer's Standard Available Colors	
Standard Color Code	**Color Description**
PW7	Bright White
PR4	Flame Red

Additional Requirements:

The vehicle bid shall include the standard equipment requirements as required in section 3.1.1.1 of the specification.

Vendor Bid Response:

Vehicle Fuel Type	Unit Price
Gasoline	$ 34,365.00
Diesel	$ 42,616.00

Options:

FOB Dealership: (Deduct)	N/A
FOB Other than Metro Charleston - Per Mile	$ 2.00

*Note - The above delivery "options" above are not evaluated as part of the award.

7. Your committee on Finance has had under consideration the following resolution, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Resolution No. 305-20 do pass as amended.

Resolution No. 305-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase 20 portable basketball goals from SNA Sports Group, LLC, of Grand Rapids, MI, in the amount of $142,760 as the result of a competitive bidding process. The goals will be used within the Charleston Coliseum & Convention Center to promote sports tourism activity.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase 20 portable basketball goals from SNA Sports Croup, LLC, of Grand Rapids, MI, in the amount of $142,760 as the result of a competitive bidding process.

Councilmember Jenkins added that this is related to a previous budget amendment from the water crisis settlement. This will allow the Convention Center to host larger basketball tournaments. He added that Resolution No. 304-20 (concerning flooring) will not be going to Council that evening as the bids were rejected and will be rebid to go along with the portable goals.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the Resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, the Mayor declared Resolution No. 305-20 adopted.

Portable Basketball Goals for the Charleston

Coliseum
Project No. 2020-006
Bid Opening: February 19, 2020 @ 11:30am

	SNA Sports Group LLC	BPI	Griffin Sports Equipment	Mateflex
	601 Three Mile Rd. NW, Suite A	109-B College Place	218 Front Street	2007 Beechgrove Place
	Grand Rapids, MI 49544	Norfolk, VA 23510	New Richmond, OH 45157	Utica, NY 13501
	P: (800) 823-0182	P: (866) 621-3865	P: (513) 349-3359	P: (315) 733-1412
	jpeterson@snasportsgroup.com	kevin@basketballproductsinternational.com	griffinsports317@gmail.com	kwheelock@mateflex.com
Project Total	$142,760.00	$143,000.00	$148,500.00	$149,920.00
Local Vendor Preference ($5,000)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Project Completion	56 days	90 days	60 days	60 days
Successful Bidder	✓			

8. Your committee on Finance has had under consideration the following resolution, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Resolution No. 306-20 do pass as amended.

Resolution No. 306-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase 2 new, unused 2020 Pursuit Ready F150 4X4 Pickup Trucks for the Charleston Fire Department from Thornhill Ford, in the amount of $71,012.56 as the result of a competitive bidding process.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase 2 new, unused 2020 Pursuit Ready F150 4X4 Pickup Trucks for the Charleston Fire Department from Thornhill Ford, in the amount of $71,012.56 as the result of a competitive bidding process.

Councilmember Jenkins added the vehicles are necessary equipment for the Fire Department to provide services to the citizens of Charleston.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the Resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, the Mayor declared Resolution No. 306-20 adopted.

Purchase of Two (2) F150 Pickup Trucks for the Fire Department

Project No. 2020-004

Bid Opening: February 27, 2020 @ 11:00am

	Thornhill Ford	**Stephens Auto Center**	
	500 Ford Fairlane	PO Box 278	
	Chapmanville, WV 25508	Danville, WV 25053	
	P: (304) 855-8300	P: (304) 369-2411	
	ceellis@mail.com	mballard@stephensauto.com	
Project Total	$71,012.56	$71,932.00	
Local Vendor Preference (4%)	N/A	N/A	
Project Completion	90-120 days	90-120 days	
Successful Bidder	✓		

9. Your committee on Finance has had under consideration the following resolution, and reports the same to Council with the recommendation that Resolution No. 307-20 do pass as amended.

Resolution No. 307-20 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to purchase 20 sets of bunker gear from Red Hot Fire Equipment Co., in the amount of $38,001.20 as the result of a competitive bidding process. The gear (jackets and trousers) will be used for structural firefighting for the Charleston Fire Department.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to purchase 20 sets of bunker gear from Red Hot Fire Equipment Co., in the amount of $38,001.20 as the result of a competitive bidding process.

Councilmember Jenkins added that this is necessary safety equipment for the firefighters.

Councilmember Jenkins moved to approve the Resolution. Councilmember Ceperley seconded the motion. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative, the Mayor declared Resolution No. 307-20 adopted.

Purchase (20) Sets of Bunker Gear for the Fire Department

Project No. 2020-007

Bid Opening: February 27, 2020 @ 10:30am

	Red Hot Fire Equipment Co	**Finley Fire**	
	1515 Lower Gragston Creek Road	5255 N State Route 60 NW	
	Prichard, WV 25555	McConnelsville, OH 43756	
	P: (304) 266-2491	P: (304) 482-2944	
	jsmith@redhotfireequipment.com	jparsons@finleyfire.com	
Project Total	$38,001.20	$43,100.00	
Local Vendor Preference (4%)	N/A	($1,724.00) $41,376.00	
Project Completion	60 days	90 days	
Successful Bidder	✓		

REPORTS OF OFFICERS

NONE.

NEW BILLS

NONE.

MISCELLANEOUS/UNFINISHED BUSINESS

1. Mayor Goodwin recognized the members of Youth Council present.

2. Councilmember Knauff asked why the large flower planters on Washington Street, between Pennsylvania Avenue and Crescent Road, were moved and who controlled that. Mayor Goodwin responded that the area was not ADA compliant with the planters in the old location. Additionally, that decision should lie with the City Planning and Streets and Traffic Departments, not outside organizations.

3. Councilmember Hoover stated that there will be a short meeting of the Planning, Streets and Traffic Committee directly after Council's conclusion.

4. Councilmember Snodgrass stated that she hoped there will be room for reconsideration in regard to the proposed budget, considering the current CPD vacancy (whose proposed salary raise is $1.00/hr., about $3,000 behind Huntington).

5. Councilmember Steele announced that March 14, 2020 will be the East End Pub Crawl. There will be a meeting of the Public Safety Committee on March 5, 2020 to discuss CPD recruitment.

6. Councilmember Jenkins stated that there will be an additional Finance Committee meeting March 9, 2020 at 5:30 p.m. to discuss the proposed budget. Mayor Goodwin added that there will be several information sessions for City employees.

7. Councilmember King thanked Councilmembers Robinson and Minardi and the Administration in their work to purchase the goals and courts for the Convention Center; it will be a good investment for years to come.

8. Councilmember Pharr encouraged attendance to the upcoming Facilities Committee meetings (March 16, 2020 and April 6, 2020) to discuss leases for several City owned properties with the various organizations in those buildings. Councilmember Pharr added that there will be some tough decisions that will need to be made by Council, and attendance would be beneficial.

ADJOURNMENT

The Clerk, Miles C. Cary II, called the closing roll call:

YEAS: Adams, Bailey, Bays, Burton, Campbell, Ceperley, Cook, Faegre, Haas, Hoover, Jenkins, Jones, King, Knauff, Laird, McKinney, Minardi, Overstreet, Persinger, Pharr, Reishman, Robinson, Sheets, Snodgrass, Steele, Wesley-Plear, Mayor Goodwin
NAYS: NONE
ABSENT: Robinson

At 8:10 p.m., by a motion from Councilmember Ceperley, Council adjourned until Monday, March 16, 2020, at 7:00 p.m., in the Council Chamber in City Hall.

_____
Amy Shuler Goodwin, Honorable Mayor

_____
Miles C. Cary II, City Clerk