

MINUTES
FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING
6:30 P.M., DECEMBER 2, 2019
A/V CONFERENCE ROOM

Joseph Jenkins, Chairperson, called the meeting of the Charleston City Council Committee on Finance to order at 6:30 p.m., December 2, 2019, in the Audio/Visual Room in City Hall.

A silent roll was taken by the Clerk and a quorum was established. The following committee members were present:

Joseph Jenkins, Chair
Bobby Reishman, Vice Chair
Brent Burton
Mary Beth Hoover
Will Laird
Shannon Snodgrass
Keeley Steele

I. DISCUSSION:

a. Councilmember Reishman asked for unanimous consent to dispense with the reading of the minutes for the November 18, 2019 meeting and that they be approved as distributed. There was no objection and the minutes were approved.

b. City Manager's Report - Fuel Purchase

City Manager, Jonathan Storage, stated that Council had previously approved Council working with KRT to come up with an economic and efficient way of managing the City's fuel purchase needs. This practice has been in place for some now. The 2-year 2019 contract will provide a cheaper rate than the previous contract. The gasoline price will be \$1.6821/gallon, which is 6.87% cheaper than the current rate. The diesel fuel is \$1.9696, which is just over 1% cheaper.

II. RESOLUTIONS:

- a. Resolution No. 267-19 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to enter into an agreement with J&J Emergency Vehicle Sales, in the amount of \$444,996.00, for purchase of four ambulances (\$111,249.00 each) to be used by the Charleston Fire Department.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager are authorized to enter into an agreement with J&J Emergency Vehicle Sales, in the amount of \$444,996.00, for purchase of four ambulances (\$111,249.00 each) to be used by the Charleston Fire Department.

Storage added that the Administration is recommending the award of a purchase contract to J&J Emergency Vehicle Sales of Morgantown, WV, for the purchase of four 2020 model year Chevy Frontline ambulances. On September 3, 2019, this Committee approved the purchase of 4 ambulances from Atlantic Emergency Solutions. After City Council approved the resolution, J&J filed a timely bid protest under the City's purchasing rules, alleging anomalies in the manner in which bids were received and tabulated. Storage held a hearing on the matter and determined that J&J's protest had merit. The Administration threw out the bids and re-advertised the solicitation. The same three companies bid on the purchase again: J&J, Atlantic, and PennCare. J&J submitted the lowest bid, with a unit price of \$111,249 (total \$444,996). Atlantic was the second-lowest bidder with a unit price of \$112,643.25 (\$450,573). PennCare submitted the highest bid with a unit price of \$118,355 (\$473,420). The two low bids were exceedingly competitive – there was a 1.24% difference between J&J and Atlantic. J&J's TOTAL price is \$10,596 less than what Atlantic previously submitted. Fire Department officials and the Purchasing Director thoroughly reviewed the bids prior to making a recommendation for award.

Councilmember Steele clarified with Storage that the anomalies were: several of the bidders submitted multiple bids, bids were submitted for 2020 models instead of the requested 2019 model and the previous apparent low bidder submitted a perceived oral bid at the bid opening. Out of an abundance of caution, the Administration threw out all of the bids. Bid openings are public.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution No. 267-19 approved.

Purchase of four (4) Ambulances for CFD

Bid Opening: November 7, 2019 @ 11:00 a.m.

		Atlantic Emergency Solutions 3045 Victorian Place Hurricane, WV 25526 P: (304) 989-4113 cawalker@atlanticemergency.com			PennCare 1317 North Road Niles, Ohio 44446 P: (800) 392-7233 ext.306 ioe@penncare.net			J&J Emergency Vehicle Sales 951 Point Marion Road Morgantown, WV 26508 P: (304) 296-9741 jbodkin@jiemergencyvehicles.com		
Item	Quantity	Make/Model	Unit Price	Total Price	Make/Model	Unit Price	Total Price	Make/Model	Unit Price	Total Price
Ambulance	4	2020 Chevrolet K3500 4x4 Frontline	\$112,643.25	\$450,573.00	2020 Chevrolet K3500 4X4 MedixRP90 Type 1	\$118,355.00	\$473,420.00	2020 Chevrolet K3500 4x4 Frontline	\$111,249.00	\$444,996.00
TOTAL BID		\$450,573.00			\$473,420.00			\$444,996.00		
Time of Completion		90-120 days			90-120 days			95 days		

- b. Resolution No. 268-19 - Authorizing the Mayor or City Manager to enter into a contract with Stantec Consulting Services, Inc. to perform project administration services for the South Side Bridge rehabilitation project. The fee is based on time and materials, with a Not To Exceed cost of \$91,605. Inspection services will include one WVDOT TRET Level 3 Supervisor, 24 hours per week for a 6-month project duration. The Construction Administration portion of the fee will include project management, steel shop drawing reviews, answering RFI's and site visits as needed.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Mayor or City Manager is authorized to enter into a contract with Stantec Consulting Services, Inc. to perform project administration services for the South Side Bridge rehabilitation project. The fee is based on time and materials, with a Not To Exceed cost of \$91,605.

City Engineer, Chris Knox, stated that in 2017 Stantec Consulting Services, Inc was hired for the inspection, design and construction plans of the South Side Bridge. This was done through a process that involved multiple interviews and then quotes. The original contract explicitly left out post design services such as construction administration and inspection. These services are typically kept separate from design services.

Storage added that this is a complex project, requiring detailed quality assurance and oversight. It is common practice to use Quality Assurance Managers in highway construction projects.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution 268-19 approved.

PROJECT COST SUMMARY

City of Charleston
South Side Bridge Rehabilitation

6 Month Duration
Feb. 1 2020 - July 31, 2020

Stantec Consulting Services Inc.

Design Labor	\$	15,434.00
CEI Labor	\$	61,615.20
Directs	\$	14,555.36

Total Cost \$ **91,604.56**

Total Rounded \$ **91,605.00**

Proposal Notes:

1. Inspection personnel includes one (1) WVDOH TRET Level 3 Supervisor with associated Project Management and Administrative Assistant charges.
2. Proposal based on a six (6) month duration at 24 hours per week
3. Lodging and meal allowance has been included in the event the approved inspector does not reside within commuting distance to the project area.

- c. Resolution No. 269-19 - Authorizing the Finance Director to establish special revenue fund 018, Planning Grant Fund, a fund that accounts for revenues received from various granting agencies for consultation services, architectural design services, implementation of blight analysis GIS mapping software, and other resources to coordinate program design and effective and strategic code enforcement efforts.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The Finance Director is authorized to establish special revenue fund 018, Planning Grant Fund, a fund that accounts for revenues received from various granting agencies for consultation services, architectural design services, implementation of blight analysis GIS mapping software, and other resources to coordinate program design and effective and strategic code enforcement efforts.

Storage stated that pursuant to Resolution No. 244-19, which Council approved on October 21, 2019, the Planning Department is authorized to apply for, receive, and administer forgivable loans from the WV Housing Development Fund for the purpose of developing a comprehensive blight mapping project and to create housing infill architectural design templates. This resolution authorizes the Administration to establish a special fund to receive the forgivable loan proceeds and allow them to be spent without the need for additional budgetary appropriations.

Councilmember Snodgrass confirmed with Storage that approximately \$30,000 will go through the fund.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution 269-19 approved.

- d. Resolution No. 270-19 - Authorizing the City Manager to purchase a print and laminating system for Traffic Engineering from Osburn Associates, Inc. in the amount of \$44,345 as the result of a competitive bidding process. The purchase will be charged to the Parking System account.

Be it Resolved by the Council of the City of Charleston, West Virginia:

The City Manager is authorized to purchase a print and laminating system for Traffic Engineering from Osburn Associates, Inc. in the amount of \$44,345 as the result of a competitive bidding process. The purchase will be charged to the Parking System account.

Storage added that on November 25, 2019, the City opened bids for a Print & Laminating System for both the Traffic Engineering Department and the Parking System. The City received one bid, which was from Osburn Associates, Inc. of Logan, Ohio. The bid was \$44,345. In consultation with Matthew Hartline, Director of Traffic Engineering, the Administration determined that the price was competitive within the marketplace of the equipment sought and that rejecting the bid and re-advertising would not likely yield a lower price.

Mayor Goodwin added that it will allow the department to do more project in-house at a higher quality.

Councilmember Snodgrass confirmed that it is a new system rather than a replacement. Storage added that the current system is out of date and labor intensive. It will most likely be cost neutral. Councilmember Snodgrass asked if this type of equipment is available for lease. Storage answered that option was not pursued, but the use the City would get out of the system would most likely be cost prohibitive.

Councilmember Reishman moved to approve the Resolution. With a majority of members present recorded thereon as voting in the affirmative Chairperson Jenkins declared Resolution 270-19 approved.

City of Charleston, WV
Print & Laminating System for Traffic Engineering
Bid Opening: November 25, 2019 @ 10:30am

	Osburn Associates, Inc. PO Box 912 Logan, OH 43138 (800) 523-8917 jennifort@osburns.com
Print & Laminating System	\$44,345.00
Total Bid	\$44,345.00

Councilmember Reishman motioned to adjourn the meeting.

Meeting adjourned.